

# Table of Contents

Volume 2 • 1997- 2003

Teresa Inman .....	723
Artie L. Jackson .....	751
Erin Luzader .....	796



**A Comparison Between  
The Physical Environments of  
Third & Sixth Grade Classroom:**

by  
**Teresa Inman**

## **A Comparison Between The Physical Environments of Third & Sixth Grade Classroom:**

**Teresa Inman & Felecia Briscoe**

### **INTRODUCTION**

This study analyzes the classroom physical environments of third and sixth grade classrooms. Several studies have found that student satisfaction, student self-esteem, and student achievement begin a relatively sharp decline during the middle school years (e.g., Berk, 1993; Eccles et. al., 1993; AAUW, 1993). Importantly, research shows that in particular the achievement levels of girls and members of minority groups tend to drop during the middle school years especially in the areas of math and science (e.g., Entwistle, Alexander, & Olson, 1994). Research also indicates a correlation between student self-esteem and student achievement (Marsh, Smith, & Barnes, 1985). Several factors, thought to contribute to the middle school year's decline, have been investigated. These factors include changes in the type of classroom interaction (Johnson & Johnson, Gott, & Zimmerman, 1997), teaching styles (Ames, 1992; Paine et al., 1983; Stewart, Evans, & Kaczynski, 1997), and parental or teacher expectations (Eccles et. al., 1993; Stewart et al., 1997). However, thus far, changes in the physical classroom environment have not been examined as a possible cause for the decline during early adolescence. Studies suggest that the physical environment of a classroom can have a dramatic effect upon student satisfaction and achievement (Pierce, 1994). Given that the physical classroom environment has been found to affect student learning, satisfaction, and self-esteem and that all three of these student characteristics decline during the middle

school years; determining the differences in the physical environments of third and sixth graders could provide concrete direction for reform.

### The Importance of Physical Factors Upon Student Learning

Evidence suggests that the physical environment may be a contributing factor to the degree of student satisfaction and achievement. Bowers and Burkett (1989) note that "educators accept that the physical conditions of a home environment influence the child's well-being; therefore, the physical conditions of the school environment are likely to affect a student's well-being." Pierce (1994) states that, "At-risk learners associate the classroom environment with failure. By recognizing that the learning environment can either enhance or detract from the student's ability to achieve, teachers can help to change this attitude." Several researchers have found a relationship between the type of physical environment and students' achievement level (e.g., Pierce, 1994; Bowers & Burkett, 1989). Other studies indicate a correlation between the physical environment and student self-concept (Fraser, 1986; Ames 1992; Taylor 1993). According to Pierce (1994), the organization of a classroom can influence students' beliefs about themselves and about their tasks. In addition, studies suggest that purposeful attention to the learning environment can improve students' motivation to learn (Foster-Harrison & Adams-Bullock, 1998; Ames, 1992).

Several studies propose various aspects of the classroom environment as crucial for student self-concept, satisfaction, and/or achievement (Dodd, 1997; Kohn, 1996; Meagher, 1990; Stewart et. al, 1997; Sutton, 1993; Taylor, 1993). Some of these aspects have been investigated (Bowers & Burkett, 1989; Frazier, 1993; Meagher, 1990; Foster-

Harrison & Adams-Bullock, 1998; Rapaport, 1998). Physical environmental aspects that have been found to be crucial for student self-concept, satisfaction, and achievement include: condition of the school facilities (Bowers & Burkett, 1989; Edwards, 1991; Frazier, 1993; Hansen, 1992), comfort, style, and arrangement of furniture (Foster-Harrison & Adams-Bullock, 1998), class size (Rapaport, 1998); classroom density (Midjaas, 1984); and flexibility in seating (Hodges, 1985).

### Crucial Aspects of the Classroom Environment

Several aspects of the physical classroom environment have been found to affect student learning, satisfaction, and/or self-esteem. These aspects include seating flexibility, overall comfort of the classroom, arrangement of furniture, physical condition, and ease of movement. One crucial aspect of the classroom environment found to impact student achievement was the condition of the building. Bowers and Burkett (1989) examined the achievement test scores of both fifth and seventh grade students from two different schools. The schools were chosen for their age and physical conditions, one being a modern building and the other an older facility. Bowers' and Burkett's study revealed significant differences in the scores of the Stanford Achievement tests in areas of reading, listening, language, and mathematics. The scores favored the achievement levels of students attending the facility in better condition. The study failed to mention specific physical differences between the two chosen schools, or the length of time the participants attended the particular schools. The researchers also did not indicate whether or not the participants were given a pre- and post-test to measure the discrepancies in the scores of the standardized achievement tests between the two participating schools.

Edwards (1991, cited in Hansen, 1992) conducted a study concerning the effects of building conditions toward student achievement. The study consisted of the comparison of students' standardized achievement test scores to the respective conditions of each school facility. The schools were chosen from the Washington, D.C. school system and Edwards statistically removed variables such as socioeconomic status of the students. Edwards' results revealed that the achievement test scores of "students assigned to schools in poor condition can be expected to fall 5.45 percentage points below those in schools in fair condition, and 10.9 percentage points below those in buildings in excellent condition." According to Hansen (1992), when school facilities are in poor condition, students are sent the message that "what is going on inside is not important."

A second crucial aspect investigated was the comfort, style, and arrangement of furniture. Foster-Harrison & Adams-Bullock (1998) conducted research for a two-year period (1995-1997) on what makes an environmentally friendly classroom. The research was conducted in 38 public schools. Through surveys of more than 400 teachers and 775 students in grades four through eight, Foster-Harrison & Adams-Bullock found that given a choice of five categories (furniture, aesthetics, comfort, instructional items, professional items) comfort was ranked most highly by students in grades 4-8. The comfort category included any item provided for student's comfort, such as desks, reading centers, etc. and the arrangement of these items. The study indicated that students of all grades consistently viewed the type of student desks and comfortable reading furniture as most important. Foster-Harrison & Adams-Bullock (1998) found that "teachers concurred with students that the type of student desks greatly influences the friendliness of a classroom."

Although only the eighth graders placed aesthetics as the second most important aspect of

a friendly classroom, all grades agreed upon what counted as important in the aesthetic category. Cleanliness was ranked as most important with use of color on the walls and decorative items such as posters and flowers also considered important.

Other important areas that have been considered include the effects of class size, classroom density, and flexibility in seating arrangements. Hodges (1985, cited in Foster-Harrison & Adams-Bullock, 1998) found achievement levels were higher in elementary, middle, and high school when flexible seating arrangements were used in the classroom. Rapaport (1998) cites results of the Studies of the Tennessee Student-Teacher Achievement Ratio (STAR) experiment where the reduction of class size increased achievement levels. In addition, Midjas (1984, cited in Foster-Harrison & Adams-Bullock, 1998) found a negative correlation between classroom density and student performance.

Aside from the aspects that have been investigated, researchers have proposed other aspects that may have an impact on student self-concept, satisfaction, and achievement. These aspects include: freedom of movement and available spaces (Dodd, 1997; Foster-Harrison & Adams-Bullock, 1998; Taylor, 1993; Sutton, 1993); classroom décor (Dodd, 1997; Kohn, 1996; Kreidler, 1996; Meagher, 1996; Foster-Harrison & Adams-Bullock, 1998) and classroom diversity vs. Uniformity (Grant, 1989; Taylor, 1975; Taylor and Vlastos, 1983).

Sutton (1993) notes that most teaching methodologies stress cooperative learning, which requires group seating arrangements. In order to create an environment conducive to learning, "children need environments that facilitate a wide variety of access to knowledge and its application" (Taylor, 1993). One way to achieve this wide variety of



access to knowledge is to emphasize freedom of movement and sufficient space for movement between learning centers. Dodd (1997) states, "that teachers may maximize learning by making the classroom an 'academic home'" which includes creating inviting spaces similar to home for the students.

The use of classroom walls and their décor have been proposed as determinants of student performance and satisfaction. Several assertions about the correct décor of the walls have been made. According to Dodd (1997), walls should be painted in colors other than "institutional green." More importantly Dodd (1997) states that student work should be displayed instead of commercial posters. Foster-Harrison & Adams-Bullock (1998) encourage the use of blues, greens, & pale neutrals to create feelings of coolness within a classroom. They also state that an environment with physically stimulating characteristics enhance the sense of community for students. Meagher (1996) proposes the use of posters and signs that encourage students to hone their communication skills. Meagher (1996) also claims that bulletin boards should be varied with themes by alternating student work during one period of time followed by literary works during the next period of time. Kreidler (1996) also proposes changing classroom décor on a monthly basis to enhance lesson themes. The decorations should initiate thought and discussions that revolve around the lessons. Kohn (1996) suggests that the walls should depict a learner-centered environment; this can be achieved by displaying student work and memorabilia. Thus, most of these researchers (Dodd, 1997; Meagher, 1996; Kohn, 1996; Foster-Harrison & Adams-Bullock, 1998) advocate wall decor with an emphasis on student work.

In addition to the wall décor, researchers have also suggested the importance of physical and functional diversity within classrooms. Taylor (1975) sums up characteristics

of traditional classrooms by stating, "All over the country, classrooms look the same—the clock, the alphabet, the blackboard, the flag, the desk. The teacher's desk always seems to be placed in the same spot." According to Taylor (1993), "architects building schools in the 50's and 60's seemed to use cookie cutters to create classrooms, hallways, and cafeterias." Taylor (1993) claims that students need diverse environments to enhance their "freedom to grow." Taylor and Vlastos (1983) assert that children learn best in stimulating and varied physical environments; the classroom should be used as a "three-dimensional text book." Taylor (1993) states that in order for students to develop into life long learners, they need a diversity of spaces such as computer labs, outdoor ecological landscapes, and art spaces. Creating a diverse environment may increase the student's love of learning and therefore, increase student satisfaction toward their education.

The literature reveals that there is a relatively sharp decline in student satisfaction, performance and self-esteem beginning during early adolescence. While teacher feelings of efficacy and types of student interaction within classrooms have been found to affect student performance and self-concept (Eccles et. al., 1993), changing these characteristics may prove extremely difficult. However, making appropriate physical changes in the classroom may be much simpler (to do and to monitor) and effect positive changes in the students either directly or indirectly by changing the nature of the social and emotional environment of the classroom. Particular aspects of the physical environment have been found to impact student satisfaction, learning, behavior, and self-concept. These aspects include: aesthetics, classroom density, wall decor, number of students in a classroom, degree of physical deterioration, desk style and comfort, and flexibility of seating. Additionally, while no research has yet been done, scholars propose further classroom

characteristics that are likely to impact student self-concept, satisfaction, and achievement. These proposed characteristics include: freedom of movement and available spaces, classroom color, and classroom diversity vs. uniformity. Given the importance of physical classroom environments upon student learning, satisfaction, and self-concept and the relatively sharp decline of those student characteristics found in early adolescence, it is worthwhile to investigate the differences in the physical classroom environments of sixth graders and third graders.

## METHOD

### Demographics

The data for this study were drawn from elementary schools located in a southern county of West Virginia. Demographic information concerning the county and state is circa 1991 and was found in Kids Count, a publication by the Annie E. Casey Foundation (1993 & 1994). The chosen schools were primarily rural; in towns ranging in population from 200 to 12,756. The predominant cultural group is White Appalachian. The largest minority population (Black) comprises seven percent of the county population. The area is economically depressed with high drop-out rates. The state-wide median annual income of families with children is \$25,490. Over twenty-nine percent of the children in this county are living in poverty. The county has one of the highest drop-out rates in the state. West Virginia has a higher drop-out rate than 42 other states in the nation.

### Sampling Procedures

Sampling occurred in two steps: First the selection of the schools, then the selection of participants from the identified schools. Schools for this study were selected

from a state-wide listing of schools, *West Virginia Education Directory* (1997). The county was selected primarily on the basis of convenience. Seventeen public schools were contacted by letter (See Figure 1 in Appendix) and asked to participate. Schools were chosen by two considerations. One consideration was pragmatic in terms of the distance from the primary researcher's home. The second reason considered was the ease of entrée due to the researcher's familiarity with several principals and their schools. Thirteen of these schools contacted agreed to be part of the study. After receiving an affirmative response, the participating schools were contacted by phone. At that time, a date and time were scheduled for viewing and photographing the sixth and third grade classrooms. Upon arrival to a scheduled school, permission was secured from the principal's office. Some principals read and signed the permission slip (See Figure 2 in the Appendix) immediately, others mailed it to us. During most of the visits to the schools, an escort was provided to the classrooms. During the time of the visit, there were no students in the classroom.

#### Data Collection and Analysis

The primary method of data collection and analysis was qualitative. The physical environment of the rooms were photographed, catalogued, studied, analyzed and coded recursively. Upon entering each of the classrooms, the walls and the furniture layout of the room were photographed. As each room was photographed, comments that would identify each classroom were logged. Each classroom was given an identification number such as 3.1.2.4. The numbers signify respectively, 3-the grade level, 1-the school in order of visitation, 2-the classroom, and 4-the order in which the picture was taken. After the photographs were developed, they were organized, catalogued and labeled with their

identification numbers. Photographs of each classroom were placed together and the all classrooms of one school were then grouped together, finally the third grade classrooms were grouped together and the sixth grade classrooms were grouped together. After cataloguing the photographs, we began the initial coding.

### INITIAL CATEGORY CHART

Initial Category	Sub-category 1	Sub-category 2	Sub-category 3	Sub-category 4	Sub-category 5
Wall Content	Academic Posters	Student Work	Behavior Posters	*none	*none
Other	Organisms	Computers	Instructional Equipment, (e.g., Easels)	*none	*none
Aesthetics	Cleanliness 1-sparkling 2-little dirt 3-some dirt 4-very dirty	Clutter 1-very neat 2-neat 3-cluttered 4-chaos	Visual Liveliness 1-very colorful 2-institutional	*none	*none
State of Repair	1-Excellent	2-Good Repair	3-Bad Repair	4-Disaster Area	*none
Spatial Arrangement	Student Seating Rows Tables Groups	Flexibility in Seating Yes/No	Teacher Desk Placement Front Corner Back Corner Side center	Diversity of Room Number of functional areas 1-two areas 2-three areas 3-four areas 4-five areas	Freedom of movement 1-no freedom 2-little freedom 3-some freedom 4-very free

During the initial coding five categories emerged. The categories were drawn from what was obvious from the photographs and from the literature. These categories are: wall content, state-of-repair, spatial arrangement, aesthetics, and other (e.g., plants or animals). The contents and descriptions of each room were noted under the appropriate category. After the lists were drawn up and examined, sub-categories were identified. After identifying and studying the sub-categories, different methods of describing the various aspects of the sub-categories were developed. These sub-categories and their

various descriptive methods are shown in the chart above.

After discerning the above categories, we examined the photographs of each classroom to ascertain the state of each classroom in reference to each category. We used two initial processes (simple counts and rating) to assess each classroom in reference to the above categories. Simple counts were made for the following sub-categories: (1) All sub-categories of wall content: academic posters, student work, and behavioral posters; (2) two sub-categories of spatial arrangement: teacher desk placement, and seating arrangement; (3) all sub-categories of the other group: organisms, computers, and equipment. The remaining categories and sub-categories were rated. These included: (1) State of repair, (2) three sub-categories of spatial arrangement: flexibility in seating, diversity of room, and freedom of movement, (3) all sub-categories of aesthetics: cleanliness, clutter, and visual liveliness. After the counting and the rating of each classroom were completed, totals (of ratings and of counts for each category) were found for all third grade classrooms and all sixth grade classrooms. Totals were compared between the third and sixth grade classrooms. The results section presents the comparisons.

## RESULTS

This section presents the results of the five initial categories and their respective sub-categories concerning the physical differences between third and sixth grade classrooms. The percentages and exact numerical totals for each category and sub-category are given.

### Differences Between Wall Content of 3<sup>rd</sup> & 6<sup>th</sup> Grade Classrooms

Sub-category	$\Sigma$ 6 <sup>th</sup>	$\Sigma$ 3 <sup>rd</sup>	% in 6 <sup>th</sup>	% in 3 <sup>rd</sup>	Differences
Academic	61	160	52%	65%	13%
Student work	14	35	12%	14%	2%
Behavior	42	48	36%	20%	16%
Totals	117	243	100%	100%	0%

#### Wall Content

The three wall content sub-categories included: (1) academic posters, (2) student work, and (3) behavior posters (including values, conduct, etc.). The third grade results for the academic sub-category totaled 65% (all % were rounded to the nearest whole number) for the entire wall content total. The exact number of academic posters was 160 out of 243 wall items throughout the eighteen third grade classrooms that participated in this research project. The results for the eleven sixth grade classrooms that participated amounted to 61 posters out of 117, which is 52% of the wall content. The results of the student work sub-category for the two grades were similar. The third grade participants had 35 posters that were student generated, which is 14% of the total. The sixth grade student work amount came to 14 posters out of the eleven classrooms, 12% of the wall content. The final sub-category consisted of any type of poster that referred to the students behavior including expectations of behavior towards others, how to behave during free time, etc. The behavior sub-category resulted in 48 posters, 20% for the third grade classrooms and 42 posters, 36% for the sixth grade classrooms

### Differences Between the Spatial Arrangements of 3rd & 6th Grade Classrooms

Sub-category	$\Sigma$ 6 <sup>th</sup>	$\Sigma$ 3 <sup>rd</sup>	% in 6 <sup>th</sup>	% in 3 <sup>rd</sup>	Differences
<b>Seating</b>					
<b>Rows</b>	9	12	82%	66%	16%
<b>Groups</b>	2	6	18%	33%	15%
<b>Teacher Desk</b>					
<b>Front</b>	6	9	55%	50%	5%
<b>Back</b>	4	7	36%	39%	3%
<b>Side</b>	1	2	9%	11%	2%
<b>Flexibility</b>					
<b>Yes</b>	4	10	36%	55%	19%
<b>No</b>	7	8	64%	44%	20%
<b>Diversity</b>					
<b>1-two areas</b>	2	0	18%	0	18%
<b>2-three areas</b>	3	6	27%	17%	10%
<b>3-four areas</b>	5	7	45%	78%	33%
<b>4-five areas</b>	1	5	9%	5%	4%
<b>Freedom of movement</b>					
<b>1-None</b>	2	0	18%	0	18%
<b>2-Little</b>	6	6	55%	33%	22%
<b>3-Some</b>	2	7	18%	39%	21%
<b>4-Very</b>	1	5	9%	28%	19%

#### Spatial Arrangement

The five sub-categories of spatial arrangement are: (1) student seating, (2) teacher desk placement, (3) flexibility, (4) diversity, and (5) freedom of movement. The student seating was divided again into three sub-groups consisting of rows, tables, and groups. Out of the eighteen participating 3<sup>rd</sup> grade classrooms, twelve (66%) used the row formation for the student's desks. Out of the eleven sixth grade classrooms nine (82%) used rows for the student's desks. The teacher's desk placement sub-category was also divided into additional groups which described the area of placement, (1) front of room, (2) back of room, and (3) side of room. The two grades ran close in all three areas of this



category. For the third grade, 50% (9) of the teacher's desks could be found in the front, 39% (7) were located in the back of the room, and 11% (2) were located at the side of the room. The location results for the sixth grade were as follows; 55% (6) for the front location, 36% (4) for the back location, and 9% (1) for the side location. Flexibility was rated on whether or not the desks could easily be moved. Fifty-five percent (10) of the third grade classrooms were flexible and 36% (4) of the sixth grade classrooms were flexible.

The final two sub-categories of spatial arrangement consist of diversity and freedom of movement. The diversity of the room was rated on a scale of 1-4 (refer to the chart for explanation). The third grade diversity levels ranged between the 2-4 ratings with 17%, 78%, and 5% respectively. The sixth grade levels of diversity fell into all four ratings with 18%, 27%, 45%, and 9% respectively one through four. The freedom of movement also consisted of a 1-4 rating scale (refer to the chart for explanation). The percentage of third grade classrooms that fell into each of the freedom of movement ratings are as follows; zero for no freedom, 33% for little freedom, 39% for some freedom, and 28% for very free. The sixth grade results were dispersed within the four choices with 18% for no freedom, 55% for little, 18% for some, and 9% for very free.

#### Aesthetic Differences Between 3rd & 6th Grade Classrooms

Sub-category	$\Sigma$ 6 <sup>th</sup>	$\Sigma$ 3 <sup>rd</sup>	% in 6 <sup>th</sup>	% in 3 <sup>rd</sup>	% Differences
<b>Cleanliness</b>					
1-sparkling	9	15	82%	83%	1%
2-little dirt	2	3	18%	17%	1%
3-some dirt	0	0	0%	0%	0%

<b>4-very dirty</b>	0	0	0%	0%	0%
<b>Clutter</b>					
<b>1-very neat</b>	2	8	18%	44%	26%
<b>2-neat</b>	3	9	27%	50%	23%
<b>3-cluttered</b>	5	1	46%	6%	39%
<b>4-chaos</b>	1	0	9%	0%	9%
<b>Visual liveliness</b>					
<b>1-very colorful</b>	4	13	36%	72%	36%
<b>2- drab</b>	7	5	64%	28%	36%

### Aesthetics

The classrooms were also rated on aesthetics which was further broken down into (1) cleanliness, (2) clutter, and (3) visual liveliness. The three sub-categories were rated on a scale of one to four with the exception of visual liveliness which was rated on a 1 or 2 scale (see chart). In the cleanliness sub-category, the results for the third grade were 83% for sparkling, and 17% for little dirt. The sixth grade results were similar with 82% in sparkling and 18% with little dirt. The results of the clutter sub-category for the third grade were 44% very neat, 50% neat, and 6% cluttered. The sixth grade results were 18% very neat, 27% neat, 46% cluttered, and 9% chaos. The ratings of visual liveliness for the two grades contradict each other. Seventy-two percent of the third grade participants were very colorful and 28% were drab. The sixth grade results however were reversed. Only 36% were described as very colorful and 64% were considered drab.

### **State of Repair of 3rd & 6th Grade Classrooms**

<b>Category</b>	$\Sigma$ 6 <sup>th</sup>	$\Sigma$ 3 <sup>rd</sup>	% in 6 <sup>th</sup>	% in 3 <sup>rd</sup>	% Differences
<b>State of Repair</b>					
<b>1-Excellent</b>	2	7	18%	39%	21%
<b>2-Good Repair</b>	9	8	82%	44%	38%
<b>3-Bad Repair</b>	0	3	0%	17%	17%
<b>4-Disaster</b>	0	0	0%	0%	0%

### State of Repair

The classroom's state of repair was rated on a scale of 1-4 (see chart above for explanation). Seven of the third grade participants were rated one, eight classrooms were rated as two's, and three were rated as three's. The sixth grade results were in only the number one and two ratings with 2 and 9 classrooms respectively.

### **Other Differences Between 3rd & 6th Grade Classrooms**

<b>Sub-category</b>	<b><math>\Sigma</math>6th</b>	<b><math>\Sigma</math> 3rd</b>	<b><math>\Sigma</math> Differences</b>
<b>Organisms</b>	4	47	43
<b>Computer</b>	25	57	32
<b>Instructional Equip.</b>	63	98	35

### Other Group

The final category, titled Other, included organisms, computers, and instructional equipment. For the organisms, the eighteen third grade classrooms contained 47 items, an average of 2.6 organisms per classroom. The eleven sixth grade classrooms contained a total of 4 organisms, an average of .36 organisms per classroom. The computers totaled 57 for the third grade, which averages out to be three per classroom. The sixth grade classrooms contained 25 computers, an average of 2 per room. The instructional equipment added totaled 98 items for the third, an average of 5 per room. The eleven sixth grade classrooms had 63 instructional items, an average of 6 per room.

## DISCUSSION

The discussion section will address the physical differences between the 3<sup>rd</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> grade classrooms found during this research and the relationship they may have to the decline found to occur during the middle school years. The differences found are classified into two contrasting types of classrooms, organic and institutional. The organic style classroom emphasizes student autonomy, whereas the institutional classroom promotes conformity. The impact of each style of classroom is also discussed. Future studies investigating the links between the classroom physical environment and student achievement, motivation, and satisfaction are also suggested.

Clear physical differences between third and sixth grade classrooms emerged in this study. The overall sum of the differences of these two sets of classrooms could be articulated as organic vs. institutional type classrooms. Third grade classrooms were found to be more organic than sixth grade classrooms. An organic classroom is dynamic containing a diversity of functional spaces, a flexible seating arrangement, room for easy movement, a variety of living organisms, and a lively, colorful room decor. An institutional classroom is static, uniform, drab, and conforming. Environmental characteristics have been shown to affect students' learning (Pierce, 1994). Our study shows a possible connection between the classroom environment and the decline experienced by students during middle school years.

The literature attributes several aspects of the physical environment (flexibility, diversity, state of repair, aesthetics, etc.) to a decline in student satisfaction and achievement. Third grade classrooms in this study were much more likely to be arranged in a flexible and diverse manner. It is likely that arranging the classroom in a flexible and

diverse manner encourages students to develop their individual learning styles and to understand their individuality as an acceptable process of growing. Competition between students inhibits the development of intrinsic motivation; rather, competitiveness encourages students to assess their own development primarily in comparison to their peers. An environment allowing for individual learning styles de-emphasizes student competitiveness and encourages the development of intrinsic motivations for learning. Intrinsic motivation for learning is far more apt to last beyond a certain class or test than extrinsic motivation for winning a competition. An organic classroom is more likely to provide students with an open door to autonomy and encourages students to achieve in ways that the institutional classroom does not. A flexible, dynamic, and diverse environment can be achieved by using varying furniture types and varying functional learning areas within the classroom. A varied physical environment promotes student choice of the type of desk they want or the method of learning a concept that best suits their learning style (e.g., a lesson through the text or a hands-on learning center experience).

In addition to the physical layout of the classroom, important differences between the wall content of third and sixth grade classrooms emerged in this study. The third grade classroom had a considerably larger amount of academic posters (an average of 8.9 per classroom) on the walls, whereas the sixth grade classrooms averaged only 5.5 academic posters per classroom. The sixth grade classroom wall displays focused more on student behavior than the third grade classroom. The sixth grade classrooms averaged 3.8 posters concerning student behavior in contrast to the third grade classrooms which averaged only 2.6. This contrast in the wall content portrays a disparity in the messages

given to the students. For the third grade students, the message is achieve and learn, but for the sixth grade students the message is behave and conform. The message given to early adolescents to conform probably conflicts with their desire to become increasingly autonomous which generally occurs during this period of development (Eccles et. al., 1993).

Our study did not show a major difference between the third and sixth grade classroom in their state-of-repair. Doubtless a well maintained institutional type classroom is better than a poorly maintained classroom (Bowers and Burkett, 1989). Yet, it may be that an organic classroom with a minor bit of chaos actually produces better learning, satisfaction, and self esteem than a very clean, sterile, institutional environment. Sometimes in our desire for cleanliness and order within a classroom, we may be creating an environment that inhibits students from experiencing intrinsic motivation for learning.

Since the physical environment does impact student achievement, satisfaction, and self-concept, then future educators should consider what type of environment best suits their student's needs. In order for students to maintain and/or excel in education, teachers must first provide an environment more appropriate to their cognitive level and style (Eccles et. al., 1993). The classroom environment should encourage students to develop intrinsic motivation for learning and where possible to provide an option to learn in their preferred learning styles. Since our society is becoming increasingly multicultural and there are a variety of preferred learning styles even within one cultural group, an organic classroom with its diverse functional spaces, room for easy movement and flexible seating arrangement, may be the classroom of preference especially for students in early adolescence.

While differences in the physical environment of third and sixth grade classrooms were found, this study does not show a direct correlation between the decline during the middle school years and the classroom environment. In addition, the classrooms investigated were all in a rural setting in southern Appalachia. Further studies must be done in order to determine whether or not a definite link exists between the physical environment and the decline associated with the middle school years. The next step that could be taken is to determine whether young adolescents are more likely to have higher self-esteem, achievement, and satisfaction in an organic as compared to an institutional environment. A further future study would involve locating a middle school with low scores in esteem, satisfaction, and achievement. If a further examination of the school reveals highly institutionalized classrooms, the teachers and principals may be willing to try changing the physical environment into one that is more organic. During the first year after participating teachers create more organic classrooms, an ethnographic observer could look for changes in both the teacher (in terms of methodology and interaction with students) and within the students.

The decline in student achievement, self-esteem, and satisfaction that occurs during the middle school years has been attributed to several factors. Some of these factors include the type of classroom interaction (Johnson & Johnson, Gott, & Zimmerman, 1997), teaching styles (Ames, 1992; Paine et al., 1983; Stewart, Evans, & Kaczynski, 1997), and parental and teacher beliefs (Eccles et. al., 1993; Stewart et al., 1997). These factors are difficult to change and monitor, however, the physical environment is much easier to adjust. The two styles of classrooms described in this study, organic and institutional, summarize differences found between third and sixth grade classrooms. The

main area of contrast was found in the wall content where each grade receives opposing messages about education. Another area of contrast was the flexibility and diversity of the classrooms which also creates opposing experiences in education. After seeing the physical differences between third and sixth grade classrooms, the possibilities of a connection between the decline during the adolescent years and the physical environment in which they learn becomes a potential area for research. Since children are our future, and many of them give up on their own potential during their middle school years, it is worth continuing the investigation.

#### References

- AAUW. (1993). How schools short-change girls. *American Association of University Women*, 83-85, 1-6.
- Ames, Carole. (1992). Classrooms: goals, structures and student motivation. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 84(3), 261-271.
- Berk, Laura E. (1993). Changes in level of self-esteem. *Infants, Children, and Adolescents 2nd Ed.* (Allyn and Bacon: Boston) p. 469.
- Bowers, Dr. J. Howard & Burkett, Dr. Charles W. (1989). Effects of physical & school environment on students & faculty. *The Council of Educational Facility Planner International*, 27(1), 28-29.
- Dodd, Anne Wescott. (1997). Creating a climate for learning: making the classroom more like an ideal home. *NASSP Bulletin*, 81(589), 10-16.
- Eccles, J. S., Midgley, C., Wigfield, A., Buchanan, C. M., Reuman, D., Flanagan, C., & MacIver, D. (1993). Developing during adolescence: The impact



- of stage-environment fit on young adolescents' experiences in schools and in families. *American Psychologist*, 48(2), 90-101.
- Entwisle, D. R., Alexander, K. L., Olson, L. S. (1994). The gender gap in math: Its possible origins in neighborhood effects. *American Sociological Review*, 59(6), 822.
- Grant, Carl A. (1989). Equity, equality, teachers, and classroom life. *Equity in Education*, (Falmer Press: New York). Ed., Walter G. Secade. P. 89-102.
- Fraser, B. J. (1986). *Classroom psychology*. London: Croom Helm.
- Frazier, L. M. (1993). Deteriorating school facilities and student learning. *ERIC Document*, Reproduction Service No. ED 356 564, n. 82.
- Foster-Harrison, E. F., & Adams-Bullock, A. A. (1998). Creating an inviting classroom environment. *Phi Delta Kappa Fastbacks*, n. 433, 7-38.
- Hansen, Shirley J. (1992). "Powerful recommendations for improving America's school facilities," *School House In The Red*. (American Association of School Administrators: Arlington, Va.).
- Johnson, W. L., & Johnson, A. M., Gott, R., Zimmerman, K. (1997). Assessing the validity of scores on the Charles F. Kettering Scale for the junior high school. *Educational and Psychological Measurement*, 57,858-869.
- Kreidler, W. J. (1996). 6 starting points for your caring classroom. *Instructor* (1990), 106(1), 99-100.
- Kohn, A. (1996). What to look for in a classroom. *Educational Leadership*, 54, 54-55.
- Marockie, H. (1997). *West Virginia Education Directory*. (West Virginia

Department of Education: Charleston, WV).

- Marsh, H. W., Smith, I. D., & Barnes, J. (1985). Multidimensional self-concepts: relations with sex and academic achievement. *Journal of Educational Psychology, 77*(5), 581-596.
- Meagher, J. (1996). Classroom design that works every time! Set up your classroom to create an effective learning environment. *Instuctor* (1990), 106(1), 70-73.
- Paine, S., Radicchi, J., Rosellini, L., Duetchman, L., & Darch, C. (1983). *Structuring Your Classroom for Academic Success*. Champaign, IL: Research Press.
- Pierce, C. (1994). Importance of classroom climate for at-risk learners. *The Journal Of Educational Research, 88*(1), 37-42.
- Rapaport, C. (1998). Summary of floor discussion (discussion at the excellence in education: Views on improving American education conference). *Federal Reserve Bank of New York Economic Policy Review, 4*(1), 45-46.
- Stewart, S. C., Evans, W. H., Kaczynski, D. J. (1997). Setting the stage for success: Assessing the instructional environment. *Preventing School Failure, 41*, 53-56.
- Sutton, J. (1993). The changing face of classroom furnishings. *American School & University Facilities, Purchasing and Business Administration, 39-42*.
- Taylor, A. (1993). How schools are redesigning their space. *Educational Leadership, 51*(1), 36-41.
- Taylor, A. (1975). *School Zone*. (Van Nostrand Reinhold Co.: NY, Cinn.,

Toronto, London, Melbourne).

Taylor, A. & Vlastos, G. (1983). *School Zone: Learning Environments for Children*. 2d ed. (School Zone, Inc.: Albuquerque, N. Mexico).

**APPENDIX**

# MCNAIR SCHOLARS PROGRAM

Teresa Inman, Scholar  
Concord College Box D-145  
Athens, WV 24712

Felecia Briscoe, Ed.D.  
Assistant Professor  
Concord College Box D-145  
Athens, WV 24712

Dear

I am a McNair Scholar at Concord College. As such, I am required to conduct research in my area of interest which is education. My research centers on the different physical classroom environments and the effects if any on third and sixth grade students. In order to gather data concerning these two different environments I hope to:

1. Interview parents of sixth and third graders
2. Interview teachers of sixth and third graders
3. Photograph the rooms of sixth and third graders
4. Interview sixth and third graders

I am writing this letter in to ask your permission to photograph the sixth and third grade classrooms in your elementary. I wish to assure you that when I write my research manuscript, I will in no way reveal the school, principal, teachers, parents, or students. The ethics of research mandate that I protect the privacy of the people who participate in my research. The schools will be identified as schools in a semi-rural environment of a south eastern state. The photographs that I hope to take will be of the rooms only without the students presence and any identifying features will be eliminated.

I hope any concerns you may have concerning the privacy of the school, teachers, and students are alleviated with the above knowledge. I hope to hear from you soon with your decision. Thank you.

Sincerely,

  
Felecia Briscoe, Ed.D.

  
Teresa Inman, Scholar

**STATEMENT OF CONSENT**

This is a statement of consent to participate in a McNair research program. The purpose of the study is to analyze the physical environmental differences between specific grade levels in semi-rural elementary schools. If you consent to participate in this study, a McNair scholar will come to the school to photograph the physical layout only of each third, fifth and/or sixth grade classrooms available. Any details or marks identifying the school will be avoided and/or eliminated before the publication of the research manuscript.

Your participation in this study is completely voluntary. You are free to change your mind or stop being in the study at any time. This form is asking you to decide whether or not you wish to participate in this study, if so, please sign in the space provided. I thank you for the opportunity to conduct this study and I am looking forward to visiting your school.

I, \_\_\_\_\_ principal of \_\_\_\_\_ school, having read and understood the information provided in this form agree to participate and allow the photographing of the physical aspects only of the designated classrooms above.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

**THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE AFFECTIVE DOMAIN  
AND EFFECTIVE TEACHING**

**RESEARCH STUDY**

Submitted to the  
McNair Scholars Program

at

Concord College

by

Artie L. Jackson

Athens

West Virginia

1998

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### PAGE

LIST OF TABLES..... iii

### CHAPTER

I.	INTRODUCTION.....	1
	Statement of the Problem.....	1
	Subproblems .....	2
	Hypotheses .....	2
	Delimitations.....	3
	Definitions of Terms.....	4
	Abbreviations.....	4
	Assumptions .....	5
	Importance of the Study.....	5
II.	REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE.....	6
III.	RESEARCH PROCEDURES.....	12
	Population and Sample.....	12
	Instrumentation.....	13
	Procedures .....	13
	Analysis of the Data .....	14
	Chapter Summary .....	14
IV.	PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS OF THE DATA.....	16



Statistical Analysis of the Data ..... 21

Major Findings..... 22

Ancillary Findings ..... 24

Chapter Summary ..... 24

V. SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ..... 25

    Summary of Purpose ..... 25

    Summary of Procedures ..... 26

    Summary of Findings..... 26

    Conclusions..... 27

    Recommendations ..... 28

    Implications ..... 28

REFERENCES ..... 30

APPENDICES ..... 32

    A. Letter to Personnel Directors ..... 33

    B. Letter to Participants..... 37

ABSTRACT ..... 41

## LIST OF TABLES

TABLE	Page
I. Demographic Data for Teachers.....	17
II. Personality Types of Teachers.....	18
III. Personality Types of Teachers by Gender.....	18
IV. Personality Types by School Type.....	19
V. Learning Styles of Teachers.....	19
VI. Learning Styles of Teachers by Gender.....	20
VII. Learning Styles by School Type.....	20
VIII. Relationship Between Personality Types and Learning Styles.....	21

## Chapter 1

### Introduction

Teaching is a dynamic, demanding and innovative profession that is much more than a professional career; it is a personal commitment. Teaching presents great challenges and involves many risks, making it imperative to attract potential educators who are highly motivated, caring and capable people. Much of the past educational research has concentrated on the cognitive skills needed for effective teaching. More recent research however has indicated the importance of the affective domain in highly effective teachers.

This research study promotes the concept that there is a relationship between the affective domain and effective teaching by examining what research has revealed thus far about the characteristics of effective teachers, their personality types and their learning styles, and by conducting an investigation of the affective domain of effective teachers. This chapter is composed of seven sections: (1) statement of the problem (2) the subproblems (3) the hypotheses (4) the delimitations (5) definitions of terms (6) abbreviations and (7) assumptions.

#### The Statement of the Problem

This research proposes to begin identifying affective characteristics that may be indicators of effective teaching.

### The Subproblems

1. The first subproblem. The first subproblem is to determine the personality types of effective teachers using the Meyers-Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI).
2. The second subproblem. The second subproblem is to determine the preferred learning styles of effective teachers using the Gregoric Adult Style Delineator.
3. The third subproblem. The third subproblem is to determine the relationship, if any, between personality types and learning styles of effective teachers.
4. The fourth subproblem. The fourth subproblem is to determine the difference, if any, between the personality types of effective elementary and secondary teachers.
5. The fifth subproblem. The fifth subproblem is to determine the difference, if any, between the preferred learning styles of effective elementary and secondary teachers.
6. The sixth subproblem. The sixth subproblem is to determine the difference, if any, between the personality types of effective male and female teachers.
7. The seventh subproblem. The seventh subproblem is to determine the difference, if any, between the preferred learning styles of effective male and female teachers.

### The Hypotheses

The first hypothesis is that there will be a pattern of personality types among effective teachers as determined by the MBTI.

The second hypothesis is that there will be a pattern of learning styles among effective teachers as determined by the Gregoric Adult Style Delineator.

The third hypothesis is that there will be a relationship between personality types and learning styles of effective teachers.

The fourth hypothesis is that there will be a difference between the personality types of effective elementary and secondary teachers.

The fifth hypothesis is that there will be a difference between the preferred learning styles of effective elementary and secondary teachers.

The sixth hypothesis is that there will be a difference between the personality types of effective male and female teachers.

The seventh hypothesis is that there will be a difference between the preferred learning styles of effective male and female teachers.

#### The Delimitations

This study will not attempt to differentiate between the MBTI of effective teachers and other teachers.

This study will not attempt to differentiate between the learning styles of effective teachers and other teachers.

This study will not attempt to determine or evaluate the preparation or length of service of the effective teachers.

This study will be limited to forty (40) teachers from eight counties in southern West Virginia.

### The Definitions of Terms

Effective Teacher. An effective teacher is one who has been selected as "Teacher of the Year" by any of the eight county school districts surrounding Concord College during the period of 1993-94 through 1997-98.

Personality Type. Personality type is one of sixteen possible combinations as determined by the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI).

Learning Styles. A learning style is one of four cognitive skills preferences as determined by the Gregoric Adult Style Delineator.

Elementary Teacher. An elementary teacher is a certified professional who teaches in grades K-6.

Secondary Teacher. A secondary teacher is a certified professional who teaches in grades 7-12.

### Abbreviations

MBTI is the abbreviation used for the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator.

The MBTI identifies four areas of personality using the following abbreviations:

(E) Extroversion	vs.	(I) Introversion
(S) Sensing	vs.	(N) Intuition
(T) Thinking	vs.	(F) Feeling
(J) Judgment	vs.	(P) Perception

### Assumptions

The first assumption. The first assumption is that the personality types of effective teachers will be similar.

The second assumption. The second assumption is that the learning styles of effective teachers will be similar.

The third assumption. The third assumption is that the teachers from southern West Virginia selected as "Teacher of the Year" for their respective school districts during the past five years are representative of effective teachers.

The fourth assumption. The fourth assumption is that the results of this study may be useful in the recruitment and preparation of teacher education candidates.

### The Importance of the Study

There are various methods available for the assessment of teachers. The field of education has witnessed a dramatic rise in assessment and evaluation. Kindergarten students are being exposed to standardized tests. Future educators withstand a battery of testing prior to professional certification. Recently, proposals have been adopted to test principals and school administrators. With the increased emphasis on assessment, the most appropriate methods must be utilized for verifiable results. The survey method was utilized for this study of the relationship between the affective domain and effective teaching.

## Chapter Two

### Review of the Literature

Teaching is a dynamic, demanding and innovative profession that is much more than a professional career; it is a personal commitment. Teaching presents great challenges and involves many risks, making it imperative to attract potential educators who are highly motivated, caring and capable people. Much of the past educational research has concentrated on the cognitive skills needed for effective teaching (Poindexter, 1993). More recent research however has indicated the importance of the affective domain in highly effective teachers (Jordan, 1993).

The field of education represents a fertile area for research. Educational research is susceptible to becoming dated due to the dynamic nature of education. Effective teaching has been examined by numerous educational researchers. One such researcher (Shanaski, 1991 & 1992) took a distinctive approach to effective teaching. She interviewed teachers recognized as "National Teacher of the Year" to identify characteristics that may contribute to their effectiveness. This study identified love of knowledge, love of children and enthusiasm as affective characteristics that teachers view as significant to their effectiveness. The study indicates that a high level of personal involvement may contribute to teacher effectiveness and effective teachers may serve as role models to students and other teachers.

A study by Easterly (1987) also supports the importance of the affective domain. Easterly interviewed 24 outstanding teachers using an instrument known as Pathfinders. Pathfinders documents the importance of the characteristics of people who enjoy optimum well being.



Outstanding teachers interviewed in the study indicated that a sense of purpose, a sense of well being, and risk-taking were significant aspects of their effectiveness.

A study by Jensen (1993) contributes additional evidence to the significance of the affective domain. Jensen interviewed "Teacher of the Year" honorees based on the Great American Success Quotient Test. Respondents directly attributed their success to the affective components of attitude, motivation and emotion. The study substantially supports the importance of the affective domain in effective teachers.

In an attempt to assess the influence of the affective domain in effective teachers, McCabe (1993) interviewed high school students. This study indicates how students view the influence of the affective domain of effective teachers. In describing, "the best teacher they ever had", students indicated the importance of sense of humor, enthusiasm, and concern for others. This study indicates how the affective domain of teachers pertains to the needs of the students.

Research, focusing on the affective characteristics of effective teaching, represents a major benefit for educational programs and educators. The positive aspects of this type of research are both practical and theoretical. This type of research allows colleges and universities to tailor their educational programs to more adequately prepare future teachers to meet the demands of teaching. The results also allow veteran educators to modify their teaching methods and style. The affective domain is clearly one indicator of teacher effectiveness. Affective characteristics can be identified by using personality assessment instruments. There are several methods available for personality assessment.

Personality assessment is not an exact science because it involves a combination of disparate factors to reach a conclusion. The instrument utilized for assessment depends heavily upon the goals of the particular researcher. Different fields require a particular approach. Results and conclusions often vary among researchers. No definitive personality assessment instrument exists. Shou (1993) attempted to investigate the usefulness of the Singer-Loomis Inventory of Personality (SLIP) in determining personality assessment. This instrument may be used when developing educational programs to suit individual students. However, due to its experimental nature, caution should be exercised about reliable results.

A study by Hartung (1991) deviates from strict personality assessment to explore the interaction between personality and environment. Hartung explores the relationship between Gestalt therapy and Holland's Vocational Choice. This type of research, relating two disparate studies, Gestalt and Holland, is basically experimental in nature. The most significant part of the study indicate which personality thrives best in a particular environment. If the studies are confirmed, implications for education can be beneficial, because the most suitable personality can be determined for an educational career.

In an effort to determine the best personalities suited for the education field, Orsak (1987) administered Holland's Self Directed Search (SDS) to adult educators in Texas. Orsak attempted to establish a relationship between personality typed and job satisfaction. The study recommends screening candidates for careers in education based upon personality type. Orsak's type of study indicates the possibility of a personality type suitable for education. Due to the lack of repeated support of this study, prudent use of it must be exercised.

These instruments for personality assessment offer several advantages for educational research. However, due to their still experimental nature, caution must be exercised. A more reliable instrument for personality assessment is the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI). The MBTI is a personality assessment instrument, developed by two Jungian psychologists, which has been widely used in several fields with verifiable results. Four dichotomous personality dimensions of the MBTI are; Extroversion vs. Introversion, Intuitive vs. Sensing, Thinking vs. Feeling and Perception vs. Judging.

A study by Taggart (1991) indicates the possible flexible application of the MBTI. Taggart administered the Torrance-Taggart Human Information Processing Survey (HIPS) and the MBTI to 500 college students to assess the relationship between personality type and brain dominance. Taggart categorized one of four types of information processors; Left Dominant (rational), Right Dominant (intuitive), Mixed (either rational or intuitive), Integrated. The study indicates how the cognitive theory of brain dominance influences the affective domain.

In an attempt to identify leadership characteristics, Sears (1997) administered the MBTI to assess personality characteristics in 4500 education students. According to the study, personality characteristics of teachers can be categorized. A significant number of education students are SFJ, particularly elementary education majors. Although the numbers are not significant, a large segment of secondary education students consist of NTPs. The study further indicates how these affective characteristics indicate leadership and reform. The study supports the need to identify personality characteristics in teachers.

Cooper (1991) was interested in the relationship between the MBTI and learning styles. His study used the MBTI to assess the learning styles of college students and professors. This

study indicates that the results of the MBTI correlates with a particular learning style. The study contributes evidence that MBTIs influence learning styles.

For the past 40 years research on effective teaching has centered on learning styles. Individuals seek to understand their environment in a manner compatible with their affective domain. An exigent need exists to investigate the relationship between the affective domain and learning styles because ultimately we teach the way we learn. Several instruments have been utilized to effectively assess learning styles.

In an attempt to assess the relationship between personality characteristics and learning styles, a Clearinghouse (1996) study surveyed 6,000 high school students through the administration of Kolb's Learning Style Inventory and the MBTI. The study indicates the influence of the affective domain on students' various learning styles. Students evaluated themselves academically according to their particular learning style. The study contribute to the influence of learning style on student assessment and the different techniques for learning style assessment.

In another attempt to assess the importance of learning styles, Hodgkin (1997) indicates how two teacher designed their classroom using the Dunn and Dunn Learning Styles Model, which encouraged student preferences and independence. Additionally, student test scores were used as an indicator of learning style effectiveness. Hodgkin demonstrates a practical application of learning styles in a classroom setting. The study further indicates the teachers' need to be familiar with their students' learning style.

In another study Hebster (1996) investigates the pattern between learning styles preference and the MBTI. The Thinking and Learning Styles Inventory for Adolescents (TLC)

and MBTI were the instruments used in the survey to assess the learning preference of 200 college students. The findings of the study support a significant pattern between the TLC and the MBTI. The study further contributes to the relationship between the MBTI and learning styles assessment.

In another attempt to assess the influence of learning styles, Kariucki (1995) administered Kolb's Learning Style Inventory to 194 college education students and teachers. The study attempted to ascertain congruence between learning styles of students and teachers to identify needed changes in classroom environment. Although the study found no significant connection between academic achievement and classroom environment, it was evident teachers' awareness of classroom environment was higher than students awareness. The study indicates mismatches between student and teacher learning styles are manageable and can be overcome. The study indicates the significance of learning style awareness.

After a thorough review of the literature, there is no indication that the MBTI and learning style inventory have been administered to determine the influence of the affective domain on effective teachers.

### Chapter 3

#### Research Procedures

This research methodology utilized in designing this study fall under the broad category of descriptive research and the particular classification of survey. Descriptive research secures evidence concerning an existing situation or condition, and survey research studies large and small populations by selecting and studying samples chosen from the populations to discover the relative incidence, distribution, and interrelations of sociological and psychological variable (Kerlinger, 1986). This chapter describes the population and sample, survey instruments, and procedures for collecting and analyzing the data.

#### Population and Sample

The survey population consisted of teachers who were recognized as "Teacher of the Year" during the previous five years in an eight county area of southern West Virginia. The counties are Fayette, Greenbrier, McDowell, Mercer, Monroe, Raleigh, Summers and Wyoming. A letter was mailed to the Personnel Director in each county requesting the name and current teaching position for each of the teachers selected as "Teacher of the Year" during the years 1994-1998. The total population was 39 teachers since one teacher received the honor twice in two different years. A sample of the population was not taken due to the small number in the total population.

#### Instrumentation

Two instruments were used in this study to collect personality type data and learning style data. The first instrument completed by the respondents was the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI), developed by Isabell Briggs-Myers, as a test for personnel selection. The MBTI is a forced choice questionnaire designed with the belief that different vocations favor different personality orientation. The responses are scored and the results are converted to the identification of four dimensions of personality: introversion vs. extroversion; sensing vs. intuition; thinking vs. feeling; and judging vs. perception.

The Gregoric Adult Style Delineator (Gregoric, 1985) was the second instrument used in this study. The instrument is a research based self-analysis instrument which involves two abilities, perception and ordering. These two abilities consist of four channels: abstract, concrete, sequential and random, which indicate a dominant learning style characteristic. Individuals are naturally predisposed to function in two dominant channels which may be concrete sequential, abstract sequential, abstract random, or concrete random.

### Procedures

Each "Teacher of the Year" honoree was mailed a survey packet which consisted of a cover letter explaining the study and asking for their participation, a demographic data sheet, two survey instruments with response sheets, and a self-addressed, stamped, return envelope. Participants were guaranteed that strict anonymity would be maintained and that no individuals or school districts would be identified in any subsequent reports. Participants were also invited to attend the symposium where the results of the study would be presented.

The first mailing resulted in a 54 percent return rate. A follow-up letter to non-respondents brought the total return to 76.9 percent. The data on the MBTI were scored and recorded on a MBTI report form. The data on the Gregoric Adult Style Delineator were self-scored and plotted on a graph representation by the participants. The data were then transferred to a computer file for statistical processing.

#### Analysis of the Data

Statistical data were analyzed using the Statistical Package for Social Studies (SPSS). The data were analyzed for frequency counts and cross tabulations.

#### Chapter Summary

The materials and methods described in this chapter were employed to ascertain and analyze the influence of the affective domain on effective teachers.

Data study were collected through the use of the two instruments, the MBTI and the Gregoric Adult Style Indicator. The MBTI is an instrument which involves individual preferences on four scales. The four scales are Extroversion vs. Introversion, Sensing vs. Intuition, Thinking vs. Feeling, and Judging vs. Perceiving. The combination of the four preferences result in sixteen possible types. The Gregoric Adult Style Delineator involves two abilities, perception and ordering. These two abilities consist of four channels: concrete, abstract, random, and sequencing. Individual are naturally predisposed to function in two dominant channels: Concrete Sequential, Abstract Sequential, Abstract Random, and Concrete Random.



The responses to the questionnaires were statistically analyzed using the Statistical Package for Social Studies (SPSS).

## Chapter 4

### Presentation and Analysis of the Data

The purpose of this study was to examine the influence of the affective domain on effective teaching. This chapter is a presentation and analysis of the data collected in the study. The remainder of this chapter is divided into the following sections: (1) descriptive data, (2) statistical analysis of data, (3) major findings, (4) ancillary findings and (5) summary of the chapter.

#### Descriptive Data

The population for this study consisted of teachers who were recognized as "Teacher of the Year" during the previous five years in an eight county area of southern West Virginia. The total population was 39 teachers since one teacher received the honor twice in two different years. A sample of the population was not taken due to the small number in the total population. Overall, 30 or 76.9 percent of the teachers returned the questionnaires.

As indicated in Table I, 80 percent (N=24) of the respondents were female and 20 percent (N=6) were male. Fifty-three percent (N=16) of the respondents were elementary school teachers and 47 percent (N=14) were secondary school teachers. Fifty percent (N=15) of the respondents had earned a Masters Degree plus 45 additional hours, 6.7 percent (N=2) had a Masters plus 30, 10 percent (N=3) had a masters plus 15, 6.7 percent (N=2) had masters degree, 23.3 percent (N=7) had a Bachelor's Degree, and 3.3 percent (N=2) had a Doctor's Degree. Eleven or 36.7 percent of the respondents has 16-20 years of teaching experience, nine or 30 percent had over 25

years of experience, six or 20 percent had 21-25 years of experience, and four or 13.3 percent had 11-15 years of experience.

**TABLE I**  
**DEMOGRAPHIC DATA FOR TEACHERS (N=30)**

<b>Respondent Category</b>	<b>Number</b>	<b>Percent</b>
<b>Gender</b>		
A. Female	23	76.67
B. Male	07	23.33
<b>School Type</b>		
A. Elementary	16	53.3
B. Secondary	14	46.7
<b>Educational Level</b>		
A. Masters + 45 hrs.	15	50.0
B. Bachelors + 15 hours	07	23.3
C. Masters + 15 hours	03	10.0
D. Masters	02	06.7
E. Masters + 30 hours	02	06.7
F. Doctorate	01	03.3
<b>Teaching Experience</b>		
A. 16-20 years	11	36.7
B. over 25 years	09	30.0
C. 21-25 years	06	20.0
D. 11-15 years	04	13.3

**TABLE II**  
**PERSONALITY TYPES OF TEACHERS (N=30)**

<b>Type</b>	<b>Number</b>	<b>Percent</b>
ISTJ	6	20.0
ISFJ	3	10.0
ENFP	2	06.7
ESTJ	4	06.7
ENTJ	2	06.7
ENFJ	2	06.7
ESFJ	4	13.3
ESFP	1	03.3
INFJ	1	03.3
INTJ	4	13.3
ENTP	1	03.3

**TABLE III**  
**PERSONALITY TYPES OF TEACHERS BY GENDER**

<b>Type</b>	<b>Male</b>	<b>Female</b>
ISFJ		3
ISTJ	1	5
ESTJ	3	1
INTJ		4
ENFP	1	2
INFJ		1
ESFJ		4
ENTJ	1	1
ESFP	1	
ENFJ		2

**TABLE IV  
PERSONALITY TYPES BY SCHOOL TYPE**

<b>Type</b>	<b>Elementary</b>	<b>Secondary</b>
ISFJ	3	
ISTJ	1	5
ESTJ		4
INTJ	1	3
ENFP	2	
INFJ	1	
ESFJ	3	1
ENTJ	1	1
ESFP	1	
ENFJ	2	
ENTP	1	

**TABLE V  
LEARNING STYLES OF TEACHERS (N=30)**

<b>Learning Style</b>	<b>Number</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Concrete Random (CR)	08	26.7
Concrete Sequential (CS)	14	46.7
Abstract Sequential (AS)	02	06.7
Abstract Random (AR)	04	13.3
CS, CR	01	03.3
CS,CR,AS,AR	01	03.3

**TABLE VI**  
**LEARNING STYLES OF TEACHERS BY GENDER**

Learning Style	Male	Female
Concrete Sequential (CS)	04	10
Concrete Random (CR)	01	07
Abstract Random (AR)	01	03
Abstract Sequential (AS)		02
CS,CR	01	
CS,CR,AS,AR		01

**TABLE VII**  
**LEARNING STYLES BY SCHOOL TYPE**

Learning Style	Elementary	Secondary
Concrete Sequential (CS)	6	8
Concrete Random (CR)	4	4
Abstract Random (AR)	4	0
Abstract Sequential (AS)	0	2
CS,CR	1	0
CS,CR,AS,AR	1	0

**TABLE VIII**  
**RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN PERSONALITY TYPES AND LEARNING STYLES**

Personality Type	CS	CR	AR	AS
ISFJ	2		1	
ISTJ	4			2
ESTJ	3		1	
INTJ	1	3		
ENFP		2		
INFJ		1		
ESFJ	4			
ENFJ		1	1	
ENTJ		1		
ESFP			1	

Statistical Analysis of the Data

Data for this study were collected through the use of two questionnaires. The first survey instrument, the MBTI, was organized around choices from four categories:

- (1) extroversion vs. introversion, (2) sensing vs. intuition, (3) feeling vs. thinking, or (4) perceiving vs. judging. The responses are scored and the dominant choices indicate the basis personality type of the individual.

The second survey instrument was the Gregoric Adult Style Delineator, a research based instrument, in which individuals' choices involve two abilities, perception and ordering. These two abilities consist of four channels: concrete, abstract, random, and sequencing. Individuals are

naturally predisposed to function in two channels: Concrete-Sequential (CS), Abstract-Sequential (AS), Abstract-Random (AR), or Concrete-Random (CR).

The data from the questionnaires were recorded and analyzed using the Statistical Package for Social Studies (SPSS). The SPSS utilizes frequency counts and cross tabulations.

### Major Findings

Findings based on the data from the study are presented under each hypothesis to which the data pertain. All statistical analysis were performed using the SPSS.

Hypothesis Number One: There will be a pattern of effective teachers as determined by the MBTI. The first hypothesis was rejected. The most prevalent reported MBTI type was represented by 5 or 16.7 per cent of the surveyed teachers. No definite pattern was indicated by the MBTI.

Hypothesis Number Two: There will be a pattern of learning styles among effective teachers as determined by the Gregoric Adult Style Defineator. The second hypothesis was accepted. Fourteen teachers or 46.7 percent were represented in one particular learning style, Concrete Sequential (CS).

Hypothesis Number Three: There will be a relationship between personality types and learning styles of effective teachers. The third hypothesis was rejected. The greatest concentration of learning styles within any MBTI was 4 or 13.3 percent. The relationship between MBTI and learning styles yielded the same results. Four effective teachers with a reported type of ISTJ had a learning style of Concrete Sequential and four effective teachers with a reported type of ISFJ also had a learning style of Concrete Sequential.



Hypothesis Number Four: There will be a difference between the personality types of effective elementary and secondary teachers. The fourth hypothesis was accepted. Due to the wide diversity of reported types, the greatest number of any type was 5 or 16.7 percent. The five reported typed of ISTJ represented effective secondary teachers. The five reported typed of ISFJ represent effective elementary teachers.

Hypothesis Number Five: There will be a difference between the preferred learning style of effective elementary and secondary teachers. The fifth hypothesis was accepted. The eighteen responses from effective elementary teachers were varied. Six or 33.3 percent of effective elementary teachers reported a learning style of Concrete Sequential (CS), six or 33.3 percent were Concrete Random (CR), and five or 27.8 percent were Abstract Random (AR). The responses of the 16 effective secondary teachers were more consistent. Ten or 62.5 percent of effective secondary teachers reported the learning style of Concrete Sequential (CS).

Hypothesis Number Six: There will be a difference between the personality types of effective male and female teachers. The sixth hypothesis was rejected. Of the 23 female teachers, the greatest concentration of any personality type was four or 17.3 percent. Of the seven effective male teachers surveyed, the greatest number of personality types represented was two or 28.5 percent.

Hypothesis Number Seven: There will be a difference between the preferred learning styles of effective male and female teachers. Hypothesis number seven was rejected. Of the 25 effective female teacher responses, 10 or 40 percent were Concrete Sequential (CS). Of the seven effective male teacher responses, four or 44.4 percent were Concrete Sequential (CS).

### Ancillary Findings

The subordinate findings of the study were generated with information garnered from the demographic questionnaire. The demographic information indicates that length of service and advanced level of education contribute to effective teaching. Clearly, 66.67 percent of repondents had extended their education beyond the Masters level. Additionally, 86.67 percent of respondents have been teaching longer than 15 years.

### Chapter Summary

Thirty elementary and secondary teachers participated in this study to assess the relationship between the affective domain and effective teaching. This study was accomplished through survey research procedures utilizing two questionnaires to ascertain teachers' personality type and leadership styles. The data were analyzed utilizing the Statistical Package for Social Studies (SPSS). Three of the hypotheses were accepted and the other four were rejected. The demographic data yielded significant results.

## Chapter 5

### Summary, Conclusions and Recommendations

This chapter contains the summary, conclusions and recommendations of the study. Specifically, the chapter is divided into six major sections: (1) summary of purpose (2) summary of procedures, (3) summary of findings, (4) conclusions (5) recommendations and (6) implications.

### Summary of Purpose

This study was designed to assess the influence of the affective domain of effective teaching. The following hypotheses guided this study.

1. There will be a pattern of personality types among effective teachers as determined by the MBTI.
2. There will be a pattern of learning styles among effective teachers as determined by the Gregori
3. There will be a relationship between personality types and learning styles of effective teachers.
4. There will be a difference between the personality types of effective elementary and secondary t
5. There will be a difference between the preferred learning style of effective elementary and second.
6. There will be a difference between the personality types of effective male and female teachers.
7. There will be a difference between the preferred learning styles of effective male and female teac

### Summary of Procedures

The five previous "Teacher of the Year" honorees from an eight county area in southern West Virginia were asked to participate in this study. A survey packet containing a cover letter, a demographic questionnaire, two assessment instruments, and a self-addressed, stamped, return envelope were mailed to each participant. The first instrument, the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI), involves individual personality preferences on four scales. The second instrument, the Gregoric Adult Style Delineator, consists of four channels, which involve two abilities, ordering

and perception. A total of 30 or 76.92 percent of the surveyed teachers returned the questionnaires. Data from the survey were analyzed using the Statistical Package for Social Studies (SPSS).

### Summary of Findings

An analysis of the data collected in the study provided the following findings:

There was no pattern of effective teachers as determined by the MBTI.

There was a pattern of learning styles among effective teachers as determined by the Gregoric Adult Style Delineator. Fourteen teachers or 46.7 percent represented one learning style, Concrete Sequential (CS).

There was not a relationship between personality types and learning styles of effective teachers.

There was a difference between the personality types of effective elementary and secondary teachers. The most widely reported type of secondary teachers was ISTJ. The most widely reported type of elementary teachers was ISFJ.

There was a difference between the preferred learning style of effective elementary and secondary teachers. The learning style of effective elementary teachers was equitably distributed among Concrete Sequential (CS), Concrete Random (CR), and Abstract Random (AR). Effective secondary teachers exhibited a single learning style preference, Concrete Sequential (CS).

There was no significant difference between the personality types of effective male and female teachers.

There was no significant difference between the preferred learning styles of effective male and female teachers.

### Conclusions

The findings of the study indicate the following results:

A pattern of learning styles is indicated among effective teachers. Differences are also indicated between the reported personality type of effective elementary and secondary teachers. The research reveals substantial differences between the preferred learning styles of effective elementary and secondary teachers..

The literature indicated there was a significant personality type for elementary teachers as determined by the MBTI. This study found no significant personality type for effective elementary teachers. It may be concluded the small size of the population contributed to the lack of a significant personality type. It may be further concluded that effective teacher populations do not yield a significant personality type.

The literature further identified a correlation between learning styles and personality types. Although this study indicated a significant learning style, the lack of a dominant personality type limited any correlation.

It is problematic to draw conclusions based on the small survey population and the lack of substantive data on the personality types of effective teachers. The overwhelming conclusion is that more research needs to be done in this area.

### Recommendations

An analysis of the data and findings of this study form the basis for the following recommendations.

It is recommended that the survey population of this study be increased.

It is recommended that the geographic area for the study be expanded.

It is recommended that other instruments be utilized for personality assessment.

It is recommended that other survey instruments be utilized to assess learning styles.

### Implications

The effective teachers surveyed in this study represented a wide array of reported personality types. Results could indicate a combination of personality types is a basis for effective teaching. Results indicated a consistent learning style pattern is essential for effective teaching. Demographic information indicated that length of teaching and post graduate studies are essential for effective teaching.

## REFERENCES

- Cooper, Stewart E. and John Miller (1991). MBTI Learning Style-Teaching Discongruencies. Educational and Psychological Measurement, 51, 699-707.
- Hartung, Paul J. (1991). Breaking Ground: A Study of Gestalt Therapy.
- Hebster, Douglas L. (1996). Comparing University Students and Community College Students Learning Styles and Myers-Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI) Preferences.
- Heldref Publications (1996). An Investigation of Learning Styles and Perceived Academic for High School Students. Clearinghouse, 69, 249-255.
- Hodgin and Wooliscroft (1997). Eric Learns to Read: Learning Styles at Work. Educational Leadership, 54, 43-46.
- Jensen and Templeton (1993). Factors Which Effective Teachers Identify as Contributing to Their Success.
- Karuiki, Patrick N.(1995). The Relationship between Student and Faculty Learning Style Congruency and Perceptions of the Classroom Environment in Colleges of Teacher Education.
- McCabe, Nancy. Twelve High School 11<sup>th</sup> Grade Students Examine Their Best Teachers. Peabody Journal of Education, 117-126.
- Orsak, Charles (1987). The Holland SDS Personality Codes for Adult Basic Educators in Texas.
- Sears, Kennedy and Kaye (1997). Myers-Briggs Personality Profiles of Prospective Educators. Journal of Educational Research, 90, 195-207.
- Shanoski and Hranitz (1991). Learning from America's Best Teachers: What Research Tells Us.
- Shanoski and Hranitz (1992). Learning from America's Best Teachers: Building a Foundation for Accountability through Excellence.
- Shou, Priscilla (1993). The Singer-Loomis Inventory of Personality: A Review and Critique.
- Skarstad, Kirsten (1996). Reconceptualizing the Role of Teacher Leaders: Collaboration among All Staff Members.
- Taggart, Kroeck and Escoffier (1991). Validity Evidence for the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator as a Measure of Hemisphere Dominance: Another View. Educational and Psychological Measurement.





## APPENDICES

**APPENDIX A**  
**LETTER TO PERSONNEL DIRECTORS**

Date

Teacher of Year  
School  
Address

Dear :

Please allow me to introduce myself. My name is Artie Jackson and I am a senior education student at Concord College participating in the McNair Scholars Program. The McNair Scholars Program, named for the former astronaut, Ronald McNair, assists undergraduate students in preparing them for graduate studies. The program links each McNair scholar with a mentor in their discipline which helps guide the required research project.

The research project I have chosen involves studying the influence of the affective domain on effective teaching. I plan to assess the affective characteristics of effective teachers through two instruments, the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator and the Gregoric Adult Style Delineator. I have defined an effective teacher as one who has been selected by their school district as a "Teacher of the Year" during the time period of 1993-1997. This is where I need your help.

I need to know the identity and current teaching assignment of the teachers in your county that have been recognized as "Teacher of the Year" from 1993-97. I have enclosed a "Teacher of the Year Identification Form" for listing the teachers and a self-addressed, stamped envelop for your convenience.

If you have questions regarding the McNair Scholars Program, this particular research project, or this request, please do not hesitate to contact me, my mentor, Dr. Sandra S. Bailey, or the Director of the McNair Scholars Program, Dr. Felecia Briscoe.

Thank you in advance for your cooperation and help in identifying these highly effective teachers for my McNair research project. If you would like a copy of the findings at the end of my research, please mark that request on the teacher identification form.

Sincerely,

Artie L. Jackson  
McNair Scholar

Sandra S. Bailey, Ed.D.  
McNair Mentor

Felecia M. Briscoe, Ed.D.  
Director, McNair Scholars Program

**Teacher of the Year Identification Form  
1993-97**

County \_\_\_\_\_

Person Completing Form \_\_\_\_\_

**1993-94 Teacher of the Year**

Name \_\_\_\_\_

Current School Assignment \_\_\_\_\_

**1994-95 Teacher of the Year**

Name \_\_\_\_\_

Current School Assignment \_\_\_\_\_

**1995-96 Teacher of the Year**

Name \_\_\_\_\_

Current School Assignment \_\_\_\_\_

**1996-97 Teacher of the Year**

Name \_\_\_\_\_

Current School Assignment \_\_\_\_\_

**1997-98 Teacher of the Year**

Name \_\_\_\_\_

Current School Assignment \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_ I would like to receive a copy of the research findings.

**APPENDIX B**  
**LETTER TO PARTICIPANTS**

February 23, 1998

Mr. Roger Persinger  
Summers County High School  
HC74 Box 11A  
Hinton, WV 25951

Dear Mr. Persinger:

Please allow me to introduce myself. My name is Artie Jackson and I am a senior education student at Concord College participating in the McNair Scholars Program. The McNair Scholars Program, named for the former astronaut, Ronald McNair, assists undergraduate students in preparing them for graduate studies. The program links each McNair scholar with a mentor in their discipline which helps guide the required research project.

The research project I have chosen involves studying the influence of the affective domain on effective teaching. I plan to assess the affective characteristics of effective teachers through two instruments, the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator and the Gregoric Adult Style Delineator. I have defined an effective teacher as one who has been selected by their school district as a "Teacher of the Year" during the time period of 1993-1997.

It is my understanding that you were recognized as the "Teacher of the Year" for Summers County Schools in 1993-94. As a "Teacher of the Year", I am asking for your help by agreeing to participate in this study. As a participant you will need to complete the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator, the Gregoric Adult Style Delineator, and a short demographic profile. You should be able to complete the instruments and profile in 30-45 minutes. Once you have completed the instruments and profile, please return them to me in the enclosed, self-address, stamped envelope by Thursday, March 12, 1998. I will score both instruments and send you a copy of your results.

Your participation in this study is voluntary and your responses will remain anonymous. You, your school, or school district will not be identified by name in any subsequent reports or presentations. The number on the instruments and profile only identifies you as a respondent so that you will not be sent a costly follow-up request.

If you have questions regarding the McNair Scholars Program, this particular research project, or this request, please do not hesitate to contact me, my mentor, Dr. Sandra S. Bailey, or the Director of the McNair Scholars Program, Dr. Felecia Briscoe.

Thank you in advance for you completing the two instruments and demographic profile needed for my McNair research project. I will be presenting the findings of my study at the Spring McNair Scholar Symposium to be held on campus. I will send you an announcement of the presentation should you like to attend and hear the results. Again, thank you for your participation.

Sincerely,

Artie L. Jackson  
McNair Scholar

Sandra S. Bailey, Ed.D.  
McNair Mentor

Felecia M. Briscoe, Ed.D.  
Director, McNair Scholars Program



Dear Participate,

You do not need to complete sections 1-13 on the MBTI answer sheet. Complete only the answer section (parts 1, 2 and 3) on the back. Please return the booklet, the demographic profile on the bottom of this sheet, the answer sheet, and the Gregoric Style Delineator in the self-addressed, return envelope by March 12, 1998. I will send you a report of your results once they have been determined.

Thank you again for your participation and help with my research project.

Artie Jackson

**DEMOGRAPHIC PROFILE  
McNAIR SCHOLARS PROGRAM  
RESEARCH STUDY  
AFFECTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF EFFECTIVE TEACHERS**

Type of School

- Elementary (K-6)  
 Secondary (7-12)

Gender

- Male  
 Female

Years of Teaching Experience

- 0-5 years  
 6-10 years  
 11-15 years  
 16-20 years  
 21-25 years  
 over 25 years

Highest Level of Education

- Bachelor Degree  
 Bachelor + 15 hours  
 Masters Degree  
 Masters + 15 hours  
 Masters + 30 hours  
 Masters + 45 hours

\_\_\_\_ Doctorate

THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE AFFECTIVE DOMAIN  
AND EFFECTIVE TEACHING

Artie Jackson

ABSTRACT

This study was designed to examine the relationship between the affective domain and effective teaching. The survey method of research was utilized to gather data from a sample of thirty-nine teachers who were recognized as "Teacher of the Year" over the past five years from eight counties in southern West Virginia. Each participant was mailed a survey packet containing a cover letter, a demographic survey, and two instruments, the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI) and the Gregoric Adult Style Delineator. The total return was 30 or 76.92 percent.

Analysis of the data resulted in these findings: The dominant personality types from the MBTI were ISTJ and ISFJ with 16 percent each and INTJ and ESTJ with 13 percent each. Preferred learning styles from the Gregoric Adult Style Delineator were concrete sequential with 46.67 percent, concrete random with 23.33 percent, abstract random with 16.67 percent, and abstract random with 6.67 percent. One respondent scored equally on concrete sequential and concrete random and one respondent scored equally on all four styles. Of the respondents, 80 percent are female and 20 percent male, 53 percent are elementary teachers versus 47 percent secondary, 50 percent hold a Masters Degree plus 45 hours, 30 percent have over twenty-five years of teaching experience, and 36 percent have between 16 and 20 years of experience.

While the data from this limited study did not support the findings of previous research that indicates the preferred MBTI of teachers to be ESFJ, the demographic data support the research that indicates the length of teaching experience and advanced educational level are factors for effectiveness.

Contributing Factors to Homelessness in Southern West Virginia

Erin Luzader

Mentor: Dr. Dannette Light

McNair Scholars

The purpose of this multiple case study is to examine and describe rural homelessness in Southern West Virginia. I wish to explore its context from an internal perspective therefore providing a greater understanding of not only the phenomenon, but also the affected individual.

Homelessness was finally recognized as a national problem in the 1980s, resulting in numerous studies. As research continues on this complex and multifaceted problem, trends appear within these studies. Here I explore some the major trends surrounding homelessness in general, and then more specifically as these trends apply to rural homelessness.

A large portion of the literature and research pertaining to homelessness focuses on the factors contributing to becoming homeless. A comprehensive model of homelessness would study the factors and interactions between the individual, social group, and socioeconomic levels (Shinn & Weitzman, 1990). However, most studies tend to focus on one set of factors, either micro (individual), mezzo (a social group), or macro (socioeconomic). Arguments have been made for the importance of each level, however, none deny the separate contributions made at each level.

Macro-level factors are the basic socioeconomic patterns surrounding housing, income, health issues, and etc. (Roman & Wolfe, 1997). Many agree that, "variables at the socioeconomic context are probably the most important predictors of homelessness...If housing were cheap and abundant, employment high, and benefits for those not employed generous, individuals who lacked social supports or those with severe mental disabilities would still have residences; those who lost housing because of fire, eviction, or domestic violence would be quickly rehoused" (Shinn & Weitzman, 1990, p.89). Unfortunately these economic and social factors are beyond the control of the homeless population (First, Rife & Toomey, 1994). The most influential of these structural causes are lack of housing, increasing poverty, decreasing income, and lack of

governmental support (Butler, 1997; First & Rife; Roman & Wolfe; Shinn & Weitzman; Shinn & Gillespie, 1994; Shinn, 1997; Thrasher & Mowbray, 1995).

There is a general consensus among structuralists that our current housing situation is responsible for a majority of the rise in homelessness (Roman & Wolfe, 1997; Shinn & Gillespie, 1994; Shinn, 1997; Wright & Lam, 1987). "The shortage of low-income housing is widespread" (Shinn, & Gillespie, p. 77), and continues to grow. Studies consistently show that the number of low-income units available has steadily decreased since the 1970s as rents continue to rise (Roman & Wolfe; Shinn & Gillespie; Wright & Lam). One such study reports that based on available units at 30% of income, there was a surplus of low-income housing in 1970. However, by 1991 the gap had grown to 5.22 million units, and rents stood at a 25-year high (Erikson, 1996; Shinn & Gillespie). It is not surprising that in 1993, 69% of those with incomes falling below the poverty line paid more than half their income on housing (Erikson). This becomes a crucial issue if the household were to incur some unforeseen expense, thus threatening their housing situation (Dolbeare, 1996; Shinn & Gillespie).

Linked to the rising costs in housing, is the rising number of individuals experiencing poverty. "The gap in affordable housing was a consequence of declining incomes as well as losses in housing stock affordable at a fixed low income... Thus to understand homelessness among families and individuals, we must examine trends in poverty and how it is distributed" (Shinn & Gillespie, 1994, p. 66). The basic trend seems to be that while all other income ranges experienced growth, the lowest 20% experienced a loss of income (Shinn & Gillespie). Neither wages nor benefits have kept up with inflation. Many researchers conclude that the government has aggravated this problem, without providing alternative relief.

Government action has contributed substantially to the increase in poverty, and the lack of affordable housing. Benefit cuts and strict eligibility requirements were often cited as causes for eviction, as the additional expenses were too much for already strained

budgets (Butler, 1997; Shinn & Gillespie, 1994; Shinn, 1997; Thrasher & Mowbray, 1995). In 1992 the value of AFDC and food stamps for a family of four was 66% of the poverty line, that is a drop in benefits by 46% since 1970 (Roman & Wolfe, 1997). Total reductions in welfare and social insurance between 1970 and 1990 resulted in a 45% increase in poor people and a 40% widening of the poverty gap. In addition to this decrease in benefits, the government has also reduced funding of subsidized housing. In 1993, a relatively small proportion of low-income renters lived in federally subsidized housing: 37% of the 3.1 million households with incomes below \$5,000, and 19% of the 3.7 million households with incomes between \$10,000 and \$15,000 (Erikson, 1996). The link between achieving stability and receiving subsidized housing becomes obvious when considering that an individual has a chance 20.6 times higher of maintaining housing if she or he receives subsidized housing (Shinn).

Still, homelessness programs suffer cuts and remain highly criticized. Critics of homelessness programs frequently justify cuts on the basis that homeless programs are ineffective- people are still homeless. Advocates of homelessness programs reply with ideas to cut police and fire funding also. After all, we still have crime and fires (Shinn, 1997).

Along with these broad macro-level factors are the micro-factors. Advocates of the structural causes of homelessness do admit that micro-factors play a role in determining homelessness. However, in this context, individual problems like mental disability and substance abuse only determine who will become homeless first (Shinn & Gillespie, 1994). As more people become homeless because of socioeconomical reasons, individual differences become more diverse (Shinn & Weitzman, 1990). Nevertheless, the force of these micro-factors should not be underestimated.

Individual level predictors of homelessness are youth, low-income, disability, and individual experiences such as housing, job, or welfare benefit loss, abuse and separation from family during childhood, and domestic and criminal victimization as adults (Shinn

& Weitzman, 1990). There is a need to explore the factors influencing homelessness beyond the lack of low-income housing and the rise in poverty. When housing is readily available, these micro-level factors come into play. In many cases the public has failed to address the role that drugs, disabilities, and chronic health problems play in obtaining and maintaining housing (Main, 1996; Shinn & Weitzman; Roman & Wolfe, 1997; Weitzman, Knickman, & Shinn, 1990). However, the true influence of individual level factors remains disputable, as causality cannot be clearly determined. Many factors that are listed as causes of homelessness may actually be consequences of homelessness. It is reasonable that becoming homeless may cause depression, mental illness, lead to poor health, job loss, substance abuse, and depletion of resources (Shinn & Weitzman). In addition, there is a concern that a focus on individual characteristics has led us to develop programs aimed at fixing specific problems that may not even be contributors to homelessness, rather than taking on the more encompassing problems like the growth of poverty, the erosion of welfare benefits, and the destruction of low-income housing (Shinn & Weitzman; Shinn, 1997). It is much easier to perceive homelessness as a result of an individual's own shortcomings and mistakes rather than take responsibility for the socioeconomic problems for which we all can be held accountable (Erikson, 1996).

This maze of factors, causes, and effects continues at the mezzo level through the influence of social groups and networks. Community groups that act as a stabilizer for the individual are considered a social network (Shinn & Weitzman, 1990; Shinn, 1997). Social relationships influence homelessness by helping to maintain housing or offer emotional support. They may also make certain living conditions unlivable, and a negative relationship may result in homelessness. Many studies conclude that, "homeless people often lack social ties, especially close ties with relatives" (Shinn & Weitzman, p.64). However, these studies once again cannot affirm causality. It is reasonable to assume that homelessness contributes to the deterioration of social relationships, rather than the lack of relationships contributing to homelessness. Social networks probably



provided as much support as could be afforded, but eventually became exhausted themselves (Shinn, Knickman, & Weitzman, 1991; Thrasher & Mowbray, 1995). Nevertheless, social ties can be the difference between living in a home, or moving into a shelter, among poor families in a tight housing market (Shinn, Knickman, & Weitzman).

These macro, micro, and mezzo factors should be studied as interrelated units. For example, factors at the micro-level may have consequences at the mezzo-level, such as child abuse leading to unreliable social relationships as an adult. It is more accurate to say that both individual and social factors interact with socioeconomic factors to cause homelessness (Shinn & Weitzman, 1990). As these factors pressure the lives of some people, it forces them to choose to live a lifestyle that is especially vulnerable to homelessness.

Weitzman, Knickman, and Shinn (1990) outline three distinct paths that the homeless experience. They delineate, "that there are distinct and varied pathways into homelessness", and, "homeless families do not comprise a monolithic and homogeneous population" (Weitzman, Knickman, & Shinn, 1990, p.88). The first path is trodden by those who had a permanent residence, but because of housing or financial instability, lost it. These individuals and families enter a shelter soon after losing primary housing and cite eviction and rent related problems as the cause of their homelessness. The homeless that follow the second path slide into homelessness gradually. They move from place to place, doubling up with many social contacts until resorting to a shelter. While one third of these individuals reported eviction as a cause of homelessness, 18% left because of domestic problems; that is double the percentage reported for those coming from permanent residency. The last group never had a place of their own. Doubling up with others and frequent moves are a way of life. These are mostly young families, a disproportionate amount of which are young mothers who had parents who received public assistance (60%). Sixty-eight percent of this group left their housing arrangements because of conflict with the primary tenant. Rent and eviction by landlords are not

primary concerns as 42% make no contribution to rent (Weitzman, Knickman, & Shinn). In effect, we can list some contributing factors, and then outline lifestyles that are likely to lead to a path of homelessness. We can now begin to relate these trends to that of rural homelessness.

Most research on homelessness was conducted in the 1980s when homeless people became visible in urban areas. Rural homelessness has only recently become the focus of research and its presence acknowledged (Laudan & Fitchen, 1996; 20). Since the rural homeless are less visible than their urban counterparts, they have received little attention from either the media or academia (Fitchen, 1992). Denial that a problem exists, or refusal to accept outside help, compounds the problem of homelessness in rural areas (Laudan & Fitchen). Literal homelessness is successfully deterred by utilizing the strategies of doubling up, living in substandard housing, and moving frequently. In this way, many of the most vulnerable individuals and families manage to remain housed (Fitchen, 20). Nevertheless, the Housing Assistance Council has estimated that upward of 20% of the nation's homeless live in rural areas (20). As homelessness continues to grow as a problem, the prevailing contributors to homelessness such as housing shortages, poverty, and the decline in government support begin to manifest themselves in rural areas.

Low-rent housing is diminishing in rural areas. As suburban residential developments and rural gentrification projects expand, affordable housing disappears. In addition, old buildings continue to collapse and become condemned, reducing the housing supply (Fitchen, 1992). The housing that is created usually consists of old houses converted into cheap apartments, or over crowded trailer parks. Even though rents for this type of rural housing are lower, incomes are lower. As a result, 42% of rural poor pay more than half their income in rent (Butler, 1997; Fitchen). Yet high rent is not the primary problem. Rent payments require a cash outlay on a regular basis for individuals and families on an unstable income. Any rental increase could result in

eviction, yet finding a cheaper place may be more expensive as this would require cash for a security deposit plus as much as two months rent (Fitchen). Home ownership is an improbable alternative as today's real estate and construction costs climb out of reach. Ownership is further complicated by land use and housing codes. These often eliminate the traditional rural strategies for low-cost, build-it-yourself housing by complicating the method of building a home piece by piece or utilizing used lumber (Fitchen).

The larger economy and the growth in poverty also contribute to rural homelessness (Fitchen, 1992; 20). Regions with an economy based on extractive industry, located in long-standing areas of poverty, tend to generate higher levels of homelessness. These areas have a net outmigration that stifles the economy. This is the case in West Virginia, where those with earning potential and education often leave the state (Laudan & Fitchen, 1996; 20). "Social and economic changes have seriously jeopardized the well being of many people who live in rural areas. Inequality between rural and urban areas, once thought to be closing, is now widening" (First, Rife, & Toomey, 1994, p. 72). In rural areas, there are few employment opportunities, and those that exist, tend to be low-wage (Butler, 1997; First, Rife & Toomey; Fitchen; 20). In addition, the price to commute to a job is steep, as there is not public transportation widely available (Butler; Fitchen). National and regional economic trends are resulting in greater poverty for rural areas, thus the rise in rural homelessness (Butler; Fitchen).

Even with the increase in rural homelessness, it is still difficult to detect. Since shelter programs and social sources are scattered, there is a greater reliance on relatives, friends, and self (First, Rife & Toomey, 1994). "...Personal networks are the first line of defense against homelessness" (Fitchen, 1992, p.100). When rural people find themselves without a home, they turn to social groups for help. These temporary stays can last for months, but usually terminate due to the pressure of the cramped living conditions. "Cramming two families into a trailer or apartment often leads to friction, and so the extra family soon moves to another temporary situation becoming part of a

growing rural population living on the edge of homelessness” (Fitchen, p.100). Instead of living with friends and relatives, it is likely that the individual or family may choose to live in substandard housing. Twenty-three percent of all rural home owners and 24% of all renters live in unsafe or inadequate housing (Laudan & Fitchen, 1996; Vissing, 1996). This results in residential mobility, a common characteristic shared among the rural poor. The rural poor are frequent movers, citing eviction, housing inadequacy (too small or physical construction problems) and leaving a doubled up arrangement as reasons for moving (Fitchen).

This leaves us with the individual characteristics of those who experience rural homelessness. A high proportion are families with children (Baumohl, 1996; Fitchen, 1992). Most family heads have graduated from high school, but those who are teenagers usually have quit school (Fitchen). Rural women are twice as likely as rural men to be homeless (Laudan & Fitchen). Generally speaking, the rural homeless population is younger, with a mean age of 31.5 years, more educated with 56.7% graduating from high school, have fewer personal problems, are less likely to suffer from substance abuse, and stay homeless for shorter periods of time (First, Rife & Toomey, 1994; Fitchen; 20). Although they may move from place to place, rural poor move within the same general area with 52.3% reporting to be long term residents of an area (First, Rife & Toomey). These people cite a variety of causes for their homelessness, but the most common reasons cited are family disputes and unemployment (First, Rife & Toomey; 20). One thing is for certain, the poor population grows more diverse as it expands (Fitchen).

All of these come together in different ways, depending on the area. “Rural areas differ widely in their characteristics and needs” (Laudan & Fitchen, 1996, p. 84). The differences in the types of problems and people found from one region to another are significant (Laudan & Fitchen). This is why it is important to understand homelessness in one specific area, such as Southern West Virginia. “Our society in general often seems to view homeless people as living on the other side of a divide so deep and so wide that

they look as if they were alien, of another place and kind, maybe even of another species. It is extremely important that we find ways to describe it that do justice to the realities of the world in which homeless people live" (Erikson, 1996, p. vii). This means taking into consideration all the levels on which homelessness is based and applying it to what the experts, the people who are homeless, have to say about the subject.

### DATA COLLECTION AND METHOD

This study will be conducted through a series of semi-standardized interviews of individuals who are currently experiencing an episode of homelessness. Homelessness in this sense is residence in a homeless shelter. The target population is located in homeless shelters in rural Southern West Virginia.

Method of Selection Selection of individuals will be done by systematic sampling. A list of residents will be obtained from the shelter coordinator. This will be accomplished by first identifying shelters in southern rural counties and obtaining telephone numbers of the shelters. The coordinators will then be contacted and the purpose and nature of the research explained.

Method of Gathering Data This study is qualitative and the following sequence describes the procedure to be used. First, after selection of participants, informed consent forms will be completed (see Appendix A). Initial interviews will then be scheduled with participants (for format see Appendix B). Notes will be taken during the interviews and, with permission from the client, also audio recorded. The data from the interviews will be analyzed and additional interviews will be scheduled as needed.

Data Analysis The information gathered from the interviews will be studied with the purpose of locating major themes in the case studies. There will be an attempt to find patterns and commonalties so that some broad suggestions and hypotheses based on found themes and patterns can be drawn.

**Limitations** This study lends itself to the subjectivity of the researcher and is sensitive to the honesty of the participants. This study cannot determine causality, and these causes are opinions of participants. Homelessness itself is a subjective experience. This study aims to capture every possible detail from the client's perspective.

## APPENDIX A

**Micro level questions/ personal history**

Is there a history of substance abuse in your family?

Is there a history of mental illness in your family?

Is there a history of domestic violence in your family?

Does anyone in your family have a criminal record?

How many years of school have you completed?

How old are you?

How many children do you have (ages)?

Do you have a history of foster care (children also)?

Were you raised with your biological parents?

What is your marital history?

Are you employed?

When were you last employed?

Have you ever held a job that paid more than minimum wage?

Have you ever had a job with health and medical benefits? How extensive was the coverage?

**Mezzo level questions/ social group information**

How often do you see your parents?

Who else do you see in your family, and about how often?

How many people excluding family can you confide personal information?

Do you have the same set of friends as 5 or 10 years ago?

Do you have any close friends in the shelter?

Do you depend on your friends here in the shelter and for what?

Do you belong to any other groups? (addiction, church, other social group)

Did you ever belong to a close knit group?

**Macro level questions/ socioeconomic standing**

Do you think there is enough affordable housing? And of what quality?

Do you think that you have adequate healthcare? good healthcare?

Do you believe that you have experienced race, gender, disability, or any other kind of discrimination? Discrimination based on being homeless?

### **Housing history**

Is this your first time in a shelter? If not, how many other times and how long ago for what duration each time?

How long have you been here?

How long do you think you will be here?

Where did you live before you came here?

In the past five years, how many times have you moved?

What caused these moves?

### **Shelter life**

Is living in a shelter a more positive or negative experience as compared to where you used to live?

Do you believe the services you are receiving here will help you obtain and maintain stable housing?

Are you anxious or nervous about leaving the shelter?

What could make living in a shelter a better experience?

### **Personal feelings**

Do you think about the future positively or negatively?

Do you worry about where you will be years from now, months from now, a week from now, day to day, or don't worry about the future at all?

Do you see yourself as good or bad, positive or negative, somewhere in-between or none of these ways?

How do you feel about your current situation and where you are in life?

What do you think most contributed to your being homeless?



### Case Studies

#### Interview 1 February 1999

My first interview was with a 47 year old white male. He is divorced and has one adult female child living who is employed as a nurse in Beckley. He was not currently employed but had been employed previously with a trucking company. He had made good wages, had health care and a home, until losing everything due to a severe drug and alcohol problem. Before arriving in the shelter he was in a Kingwood hospital for drug rehabilitation. At the current time he has been dry for 6 months. He has now spent over 2 months in this shelter, but is looking for a place to live. He now receives disability payments due to his mental state. He cannot speak clearly; this is a result of drug and alcohol abuse over the course of almost 30 years.

He does have at least one close friend in Beckley, and is now attending a church near the shelter. He does not keep in contact with his daughter. He had lived with her before, but conflict arose between him and his daughter's boyfriend and he was forced to move out.

He has no history of foster care and was raised by both his parents. He has a criminal record consisting mainly of assault and battery, public drunkenness, and DUI. He says that he has had negative experiences due to his homelessness, such as being harassed when people find out where he lives. He says most definitely, his substance abuse history has caused his homelessness.

When I returned to the shelter six months later, I was informed that he had secured housing and was still attending church. However, he lived by himself, and soon started drinking again. He is now back in Pinehaven shelter in Beckley.

#### Interview 2

\*Bob is a 26 year old white male. He reminds you of a big kid and laughs at about every other thing that is said. He likes to draw cartoon characters, mostly Looney Toons, and is good at it. He has a whole book of these drawings and signs and dates each one. He has never been married nor has any children. Bob is currently employed as a janitor at a church near the shelter and is paid 100 dollars a month. This is the most he has ever made.

Bob is from Williamson in Mingo county, which is a very rural area. This is his first time in a shelter and he has been there for about 4 months. Bob has a very rough family history, but was open in sharing it with me. Bob says that his father took him and his sister out of school after the sixth grade. He said he did well in school until his family moved down a long holler in the woods where he would have to walk a mile to the bus stop and he missed the bus too often. He was picked on a lot in school and only had one friend who he says he later found out was gay, but none the less a "real good friend". His father did not like people coming around the house, and mostly kept him, his sister and step-mother closed up in the house. Bob claims both he and his sister were locked up in their bedroom most of the time. He also said that if anyone came down the holler, then his father would set roofing tacks under their tires or chase them off with shotguns. Bob said the landlord kicked them out of the house, mostly because of his dad's crazy behavior and they moved to Delbar out in the country beside his Aunt (mother's side) and Uncle (father's side). The house must not have been in good shape because he said they kept gates in their bedroom doorways to keep the dogs out, because the dogs would run through the house. Apparently the landlord let them stay there for free. After they stopped going to school, his father started raping his sister, banging on the walls and throwing water on her to get her out of bed. Bob said he couldn't stand it and his step-mother ignored it. His father went to the extremes of thrashing to kill Bob's sister if she refused to give into his will. Bob tried contacting the law in regards to his sister's treatment, but his sister and step-mother would lie and defend his father. When he was

23, he caught his father on top of his sister and his father jumped up and started beating him. After that, his father kicked him out of the house and he moved in with his Aunt (mother's side) about a mile down the road. He stayed there for a while but had to move in with his uncle (father's side), because his Aunt's children who were living with their father, moved back in with her and there was no room. His Uncle was friendly for a couple months but then drugged him and raped him twice. When Bob tried to tell his parents and his cousins, neither believed him. Later, Bob was confronted by three different boys who said his Uncle had done the same thing to them. In addition to the sexual abuse, his uncle also would steal his mail and take his food stamps but would not allow Bob to eat with him and his daughter. His Uncle also wrote bad checks and had Bob lie to the police about his whereabouts. On top of all of this, Bob became heavily involved with drugs (mostly pot) and alcohol while living with his uncle. At his uncle's he did have more freedom, which led to hanging out with what Bob describes as "the wrong crowd" and becoming involved in petty crime. Bob tried to talk to his father, but his father insisted that he never wanted to see him again. Bob said that he used to have a bad temper and when his father said that he never wanted to see him again he went to his Aunt's house and got a knife and intended to "carve him up", until his Aunt talked him out of it. August of '98 was the last time Bob had talked to his father. Since Bob moved out, his parents did not want him to have contact with his sister. They would go to the extreme of never leaving her home alone in case Bob might try to get in contact with her. Over the course of the next several months, Bob noticed that his step-mother stopped getting the mail and doing the shopping. When he asked his Aunt why, she said that his father no longer allowed her out in public. When Bob finally went to the postmaster about his missing mail, his Uncle kicked him out of the house, threatening his life if he did not leave. Bob then stayed a couple nights with a friend and one night beside the railroad tracks before a neighbor called the Department of Health and Human Resources and Bob was transported to this shelter.

Bob says that life in the shelter is a much more positive experience than living with his father or his uncle. Since he's been at the shelter he has been to counseling and is now on an anti-depressant. He believes that it will take him a long time to save up enough money to pay rent on his own place. He wants to try for his GED in the near future. At the shelter he has a lot more freedom than he had at home. He looks forward to having his own place and his own rules, even though he's a little nervous about being on his own. Bob now attends church every Sunday morning, night, and Wednesday evenings. He says the church is like his family. When considering his future, he only considers day to day worries, and whether tomorrow will be better or worse. Bob says family problems were the cause of his homelessness and he is glad that he escaped, because he feels that if he had not, he would have committed suicide. Bob thinks he would like to work with teenagers dealing with drug abuse and depression because of his own experiences.

When I returned to the shelter six months later, I found out that Bob had started taking classes, and was doing very well. Unfortunately, Bob was engaging in homosexual behavior with one of the other male residents and was released from the shelter.

Another six months later, Bob was back in Stone Haven and told me his version of what happened since we last talked in Feb. 1999 (almost a year ago). Apparently Bob returned to the shelter one night with a drunk friend. They were released from the shelter. From there they went to live with some friends who had moved out of the shelter and in with their mother. While at that house, he became involved in drugs and alcohol again. He said he was becoming addicted to marijuana and crack. He recalls days when he would wake up in places and not know how he got there. From there he moved into his own apartment. Not long into his stay there, one of his friends raped a 16 year old girl in his bathroom. Bob felt the police were watching his friend at his apartment and he moved out and in with his girlfriend. A few months into that, the apartment was

condemned and they had to move out. She moved in with her grandmother and Bob stayed with a friend, who was also apparently his partner. His friend was quick to make him move out because he did not want his parents to discover that he was homosexual. Bob is now openly bi-sexual, and while he stayed with his friends in Beckley he worked at a gay bar. Bob says he has been harassed and threatened because of his sexual orientation. From there Bob went back into the shelter in Beckley and the next day was transferred to Stonehaven. He has been there since right before Christmas. His plans include finding a place near the shelter because if he moves back to Beckley he will get involved in the same crowd. A year ago Bob had few friends, now he has many contacts through his stays at the shelter.

Over the past summer, Bob spoke with his aunt who informed him that his parents and sister had moved. They did not want him to know where they moved. Bob mentioned this time that his sister still lives with his parents and that she is mentally and physically handicapped.

Bob plans on staying in the shelter for two or three months, until he has enough money to move out. He has a job at a near by car wash and plans on staying in the area. Bob is still seeing a counselor at Southern Highlands and is on Zoloft for depression.

#### Interview #3 August 1999

Fred is a 72 year old white male. Fred is dying of cancer, and has trouble speaking without coughing. Fred had one step child, but he is now dead. His wife is in a nursing home because she is paralyzed from the waist down and Fred is unable to care for her. Fred lives on social security and a small government pension from his service in the Army during the Korean War. He has relatively good healthcare through the VA.

Fred is homeless because a woman that he had hired to take care of him started stealing his checks, then his furniture, and then she left town. Fred had no way to pay his house payment, therefore losing his home and forcing him into a shelter. The police are

still searching for the woman. Today would have been Fred's final payment and he would have owned his home.

Fred says most of his relatives are dead and his sister and law is the only person he used to talk to, and he has not talked to her in a while. He did belong to the American Legion for 49 years, but could not attend meetings from where he was living previously.

Fred has been in the shelter for three months. He wants to leave the shelter and have his own home again while he still has some time left to spend with his wife. However, he does not see his future as very positive and he says he does not know where he will be and does not really care.

When I later returned to the shelter, I inquired about Fred. His situation had not improved. His medical condition worsened and he was hospitalized. He now lives in a nursing care facility. It was unknown if this was the facility in which his wife was residing.

#### Interview #4

Jimmy is a 28 year old black male. He is very mild mannered and seems honest and unapologetic about his current situation. He is single with no children and unemployed. He is from Mayberry in McDowell County. The last job he held was in recycling when he lived in Princeton a year ago, and was paid minimum wage with no benefits. He has held jobs in construction with benefits, but was laid off.

This is Jimmy's first time in a shelter and he has been here for about a month. Before he came here, he and his sister and her children all lived with his father. Apparently the father was very violent, often threatening to shoot members of the family if he did not get his way. Jimmy's mom moved out long ago, and the violence got worse towards him, his sister and her children. Having nowhere else to go, they moved into the shelter. Jimmy seems to believe that there are no places to rent, everyone wants to sell. Jimmy says moving to the shelter was a positive step and he is anxious to move on with his life.

Jimmy is a pessimist. He believes nothing good ever happens, and if it does, then it surprises him. Jimmy says he has no friends outside of the shelter, and has never belonged to a close group besides his family. He does see his mom, and his brother about once a week. Jimmy tries to plan his life according to where he wants to be years from now. Ideally, that would be on the west coast, far away from his father.

Shortly after this interview, Jimmy was asked to leave the shelter because of behavioral problems. He now lives right down the road from the shelter with his sister and his sister's children.

#### Interview #5

Vicki is a 32 year old black woman. She is the sister of Jimmy. Vicki has four children ages 17, 13, 12, and 10. She has custody of all four and they are with her in the shelter. The children have no contact with their father(s). Vicki is employed at Mullens Manor which is a center for adolescents. She has only been there for 2 weeks. She is full time and does have benefits. Vicki did graduate from high school, then went to Bluefield State, and received her LPN certification.

Vicki left her home in Mayberry for the same reasons as her brother Jimmy. She also views the shelter as a more positive experience than where she lived before, but unlike her brother, she thinks of her future as very positive also. She says where she lived before, she saw everything as being negative, but now she has hope of a better life.

Vicki does have friends outside of the shelter at work, but has never belonged to a close group. Vicki was raised by her adoptive parents, and does not know her biological parents. Vicki does see her adoptive mother once in a while, but does not know any of her other relatives.

Vicki says she is receiving services to help her obtain stable housing but there are not enough places to rent. In addition to the troubles of finding a home are the difficulties of finding income to pay for a home. When employers find out that she is

homeless and with four children, they do not want to hire her. Vicki says that people think that the homeless stay homeless because they want to be homeless, but she says really, sometimes people cannot help what happens to them. At one time she was very embarrassed to tell anyone what went on in her home, but she now realizes that getting out and getting help was the right thing to do. Vicki just wants a better life for her kids.

Upon a later return to the shelter, Vicki was still working and living in an apartment not far from the shelter.

Interview #6 : January 17, 2000

\*Jerry is a 39 year old white male. He is nicely dressed, has good hygiene, does not show any signs of illness, and speaks clearly and coherently. He gives short direct answers, sure not to give me more information than I specifically ask for. I felt like he talked to me because he was more interested in what I was doing and asking about than anything else. Usually clients want to talk to me because they are eager to tell me what they have been through, but Jerry was not very open about his experience and I believe parts of the story are missing.

Jerry arrived at Stone Haven two weeks ago. He claims that he, along with his brother in law and sister, left the place he was renting in North Carolina to come up here. He specifically wanted to see his two daughters, one of which he last saw in 1994, and the other he has not had contact with for 15 years. His brother-in-law and sister are staying with the brother-in-law's mother in Welch. He says there are issues there.

The brother-in-law has recently started collecting disability and together they are planning to save for the next two months and then move back to North Carolina and open a body shop. He and his brother in law operated a body shop once before. Before that, he worked in a furniture factory making \$11 dollars an hour with benefits. He was laid off. Jerry claims that he is planning for his future and he sees it in a positive light.



Besides his sister and brother in law, Jerry has few other friends, none of whom he feels he can confide in personal information. Jerry claims that the only other people he can confide in live in the shelter now. He belongs to no groups and has not since he was a child. Jerry was raised by his biological parents and claims that he had a good home life. He has three brothers that live in Princeton, but they do not really speak anymore. Both of his parents have passed away.

#### Interview # 7

Harry is a 47 year old white male. He is mentally and physically handicapped. He cannot focus his eyes on me and his hands shake. He has a stutter and has a hard time getting out what he wants to say. Harry has lived in the shelter system for about 4 years now, since the friend he was living with kicked him out.

A mining accident was the cause of Harry's condition. In 1986 he was entering the mine when the brakes gave and he went crashing into the mine's air intake. He sustained severe head injuries. Harry says he was diagnosed schizophrenic, but his diagnosis, he says, is a much longer word now, and he can not remember exactly what it is. He is on a lot of medication. When I asked the monitor what medication he was on, he said it would take a week to list it.

Before Harry was injured he had mined for nearly 20 years. He can still describe the equipment he used and details about mining. He says he loved working and would love to go back, but he knows that mining is dangerous and you have to be able to remember things and think clearly, which he has a problem doing. He recalls seeing a truck pass the shelter hauling safety timbers. It made him wish he could get to work and be out on his own. Harry does not know much about anything else but mining. He was 16 when he quit school and went to work

After saving his money from disability and social security, Harry has enough to move out, but he is unable to care for himself due to the amount of medication he has to take. I believe if he lived in a group home or somewhere under minimal supervision, he

could do fine on his own. Harry worries about moving out of the shelter because he does not want to end up in a mental hospital again. He has no one to take care of him. He has two boys and a girl, but has not seen them in years and would not know where to look. His children came from a broken marriage, where his wife left with the children and never came back. Harry does have a brother and sister that he visits on weekends and who come and see him often. His sister had been hospitalized for some unspecified mental illness, but Harry says she has recovered. I have the impression they do not have the resources to take Harry in.

#### Interview #8

Harriet is a 61 year old white female with few teeth. Before she came to the shelter, she was living with some individuals who charged her 250.00 a month in addition to help paying the bills. These individuals were not health professionals and were guilty of both physical and mental abuse of Harriet and her son. Harriet's son is now in Mullins Manor. He is 34 and a diagnosed schizophrenic. Before Harriet lived with her "caregivers" she lived in her own home, with her son, for the past 59 years. She was forced to move out of the house because it had no indoor plumbing and she could not pay to have it installed.

Harriet has been married and widowed twice. Her last husband was an alcoholic and died of kidney failure. She has three brothers in the area that she last saw at Christmas and two sisters, one of which is currently hospitalized for a heart condition. Her oldest brother is in Pinehaven Shelter in Beckley. He is crippled from a heart attack and stroke. Harriet does get to see her son often. She attends church and goes to the senior center near the shelter occasionally.

Harriet has been living on disability and Social Security for many years now. This is her first time in a shelter. She never expected to ever be staying in a shelter, but she is grateful that she had a place to go. She says the shelter is a much better place than where she used to live. She says she'd pay to stay there, but they won't let her, and her son can't be with her. She refers to the shelter staff as "like family". She wants to live in

Mullins, so the shelter staff can keep in touch. Harriet says a run of bad luck has caused her episode of homelessness.

### ANALYSIS

The following analysis examines each case study on the micro, mezzo, and macro levels.

#### Case 1

Micro factors- Drug addiction, mental disability, criminal record

Mezzo factors- Divorced, little social or family contacts

Macro factors- Discrimination based on homelessness, unemployed, inadequate drug treatment

#### Case 2

Micro factors- Bisexual, drug abuse, lack of education

Mezzo factors- Abusive family, bad group of friends, exhausted social networks

Macro factors- Lack of intervention by school or human services, discrimination based on sexuality, lack of well paying employment

#### Case 3

Micro factors- Bad health, age, victim of a crime

Mezzo factors- Involuntary withdrawal from social networks

Macro factors- Healthcare, lack of intervention by officials

#### Case 4

Micro factors- Behavioral problems, race

Mezzo factors- Violent father, no social networks

Macro factors- Unemployment, lack of housing

**Case 5**

**Micro factors-** Four children, adopted, race, gender

**Mezzo factors-** Family violence, few networks

**Macro factors-** Low pay, little affordable housing, discrimination

**Case 6**

**Micro factors-** Education level

**Mezzo factors-** Broken family, no friends

**Macro factors-** Unemployment

**Case 7**

**Micro factors-** Mentally and physically handicapped, education level,

**Mezzo factors-** Exhausted social networks

**Macro factors-** Lack of programs for the mentally ill

**Case 8**

**Micro factors-** Age, education, dependent son, abused, and victimized

**Mezzo factors-** Networks cannot support her

**Macro factors-** No home care, low income, lost home (inadequate)

**GENERAL CONCLUSIONS**

- None of the case studies had ever lived in stable or adequate housing. All but one had been renters most of their lives.
- All but one have extreme financial difficulty and have lived most of their lives below the poverty line.
- All had used and exhausted mezzo level resources, including: relatives, friends, and community members

- None of the individuals specifically blame lack of support from the education system, law, state, local, or federal governments. This further substantiates that the homeless are powerless to change the underlying structural causes of their problems. They are unaware these causes even exist.
- Three of the eight were mentally ill and one had a mentally ill dependent.
- All were living on the edge of homelessness. One small shove put all of them in a shelter.
- Three of the eight experienced an abusive family of origin.
- Two had been taken advantage of by caregivers.
- The shelter does help most obtain housing or services but in some cases is a contributor to problems.
  - \* Stifles independent will
  - \* Focus on changing micro factors/ ignoring structural level obstacles
  - \* Jobs remain low income
  - \* Individuals abusing alcohol or drugs influence other clients
  - \* Part of the clients' already meager income goes to the shelter

The following table shows factors both reported by the client and also those inferred from the interviews.

<b>Macro</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>Low Income</b>		X	X	X	X	X		X
<b>Health Care</b>			X					X
<b>No Intervention</b>	X	X	X				X	X
<b>Discrimination</b>	X	X			X			
<b>Housing</b>		X	X	X	X	X		X
<b>Mezzo</b>								
<b>Family</b>	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
<b>Friends</b>	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
<b>Community</b>	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
<b>Micro</b>								
<b>Drugs</b>	X	X						
<b>Sexuality</b>		X						
<b>Race</b>				X	X			
<b>Education</b>		X				X	X	X
<b>Abuse</b>		X						X
<b>Criminal Record</b>	X							
<b>Mentally ill</b>	X	X		X			X	
<b>Foster Care</b>					X			

## References

- Butler, S. (1997). Homelessness among AFDC families in a rural state: It is bound to get worse. Journal of Women and Social Work, 12, 427-452.
- Dolbeare, C. (1996). Housing policy: A general consideration. In Baumohl, J. (Ed), Homelessness in America (pp.20-38). Arizona: Oryx Press.
- Erikson, K. (1996). Foreward. In Baumohl, J. (Ed), Homelessness in America (pp. i-xi). Arizona: Oryx Press.
- Fitchen, J. (1992). On the edge of homelessness: Rural poverty and housing insecurity. Rural Sociology, 52, 173-193.
- First, R., Rife, J. & Toomey, B. (1994). Homelessness in rural areas: Causes, patterns, and trends. Social Work, 39, 97-107.
- Laudan, A., Fitchen, J. (1996). Rural homelessness: A synopsis. In Baumohl, J. (Ed), Homelessness in America (p. 81-91). Arizona: Oryx Press.
- Main, T. (1996). Analyzing evidence for the structural theory of homelessness. Journal of Urban Affairs, 18, p. 449-457.
- Roman, N. & Wolfe, P. (1997). The relationship between foster care and homelessness. Public Welfare, 55, 4-9.
- Shinn, M. (1997). Family homelessness: State or trait? American Journal of Community Psychology, 25, 755-770.
- Shinn, M. & Gillespie, C. (1994). The roles of housing and poverty in the origins of homelessness. American Behavioral Scientist, 37, 505-521.
- Shinn, M., Knickman, J. & Weitzman, B. (1991). Social Relationships and vulnerability to becoming homeless among poor families. American Psychologist, 42, 1180-1186.
- Shinn, M. & Weitzman, B. (1990). Research on homelessness: An introduction. Journal of Social Issues, 46, 1-11.

- Thrasher, S. & Mowray, C. (1995). A strengths perspective: An ethnographic study of homeless women with children. Health and Social Work, 20, 93-101.
- Vissing, Y. (1996). Out of sight, out of mind: Homeless children and families in small-town America. New York: Penguin Press.
- Weitzman, B., Knickman, J. & Shinn, M. (1990). Pathways to homelessness among New York City families. Journal of Social Issues, 46, 125-140.
- Wright, J. & Lam, J. (1987). Homelessness and the low-income housing supply. Social Policy, 48-53.